# Can a Father be Careful? Critics Toward the Winnicott's Theory Fatherhood

Fábio Roberto Rodrigues Belo<sup>1</sup>
Marcela Rêda Guimarães
Kaio Adriano Batista Fidelis
Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais, Belo Horizonte-MG, Brasil

Abstract: In this work we have done a journey in the major theoretical texts in which Winnicott discusses the father's role. We also consulted clinical cases in order to find out how this paternal function is analyzed in the clinical practice. In Winnicott's work, the father figure appears as a supporting to the maternal care work, often linked to environmental conditions and in several others as a substitute that mimics strictly maternal characteristics. We noticed in Winnicott's writings a clear rapprochement between the father and man terms, contributing to a normative representation of the family. The very Winnicott's theory can be used to deconstruct what we consider an ideological fold in the author's work, through the confrontation of his own texts, as suggested by the methodology proposed by Laplanche, used in this article. Such deconstruction allows us to think, from this perspective, about new family formats (homoaffective and single parent families, for example) that can increase the creative potential in the relationship between an adult and a baby.

Keywords: Winnicott; father; child care.

# Pode um Pai Ser Cuidadoso?

## Crítica à Teoria da Paternidade em Winnicott

Resumo: neste trabalho, fizemos um percurso nos principais textos teóricos nos quais Winnicott aborda a função do pai. Recorremos também aos casos clínicos para localizar como essa função paterna é analisada na prática clínica. Na obra de Winnicott, a figura paterna aparece como coadjuvante ao trabalho de cuidado materno, muitas vezes atrelado a condições do ambiente e em diversas outras como um substituto que mimetiza características rigorosamente maternais. Percebemos em Winnicott uma clara aproximação entre os termos pai e homem, que contribuem para uma imagem normativa da família. A própria teoria winnicottiana pode ser utilizada para desconstruir o que consideramos uma dobra ideológica na obra do autor, por meio do confronto de seus próprios textos, como sugere a metodologia proposta por Laplanche, utilizada neste artigo. Tal desconstrução permite pensar, a partir dessa perspectiva, novos formatos familiares (homoafetivos e monoparentais, por exemplo) que aumentem o potencial criativo no relacionamento de um adulto com o bebê.

Palavras-chave: Winnicott; pai; comportamento de cuidado da criança.

# **Un Padre Puede Ser Cuidadoso?**

## Crítica a la Teoría de la Paternidad en Winnicott

**Resumen:** En este trabajo hicimos un recorrido por los principales textos teóricos en los cuales Winnicott enfoca la función paterna. Recorremos también a los casos clínicos para localizar cómo la función paterna es analizada en la práctica clínica. En la obra de Winnicott, la figura del padre aparece como coadyuvante al trabajo del cuidado materno.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> E-mail: fabiobelo76@gmail.com

éste muchas veces relacionado a las condiciones del ambiente y en otras como un substituto que mimetiza características rigurosamente maternales. Percibimos en Winnicott una clara aproximación entre los términos padre y hombre, contribuyendo a una imagen normativa de la familia. La propia teoría winnicottiana puede ser utilizada para deconstruir lo que consideramos una deficiencia ideológica en la obra del autor, a través de la confrontación de sus propios textos, como sugiere la metodología propuesta por Laplanche, utilizada en este artículo. Tal desconstrucción permite pensar, a partir de esta perspectiva, nuevos formatos familiares (homoafectivo y monoparental, por ejemplo), que aumenten el potencial creativo en la relación de un adulto con el bebé.

Palabras clave: Winnicott; padre; conducta de cuidado del niño.

The father is widely discussed in the psychoanalytic theory and to his role is assigned great importance in the constitution and in the children's psychological development. In the Oedipus complex, the father appears as the figure that prevents the consummation of the child love to his mother, he introduces the castration and so the child enters in the society - the father prevents the incest and introduces the culture, the law. This brief example points to the value that the father figure has in the psychoanalytic theory.

In Winnicott's theory, the mother is thoroughly addressed and to the father is assigned a supporting role. This study aims, in contrast to the emphasis solely dedicated to the mother's role, to analyze the father's role in the Winnicott's theory, contrasting as this is covered in the theoretical texts and in the clinical cases. It is proposed to outline a dialogy among the Winnicott's theory, the services performed by the psychoanalyst and the positions attributed to the father in these two conditions. We have chosen texts of various moments of the author's work in order to show the tensions and stays of the viewpoints on the father. Therefore, there is not a chronological selection of the analyzed texts, but of content. We follow the Dethiville track (2014) which points to the presence of the father in the theoretical texts and in the clinical cases, although in supporting basis, but crossing the entire production of the English psychoanalyst. In addition, it is tried to deconstruct what appears to be an ideological fold in the psychoanalytic theory with regard to the speeches on the fathers relationship and their babies, which is demonstrated in the naturalized very idea on the father's role.

The work to transpose the concept of fold approached by Deleuze (1992) for the reading of Winnicott's work is to read his texts attentive to their singularities, the concepts and in the seem to be general theses by the author. Furthermore, to search what differentiates itself, what ranges, forks, what is not inflexible, in particular with regard to the father's role. To continue the Deleuze (1992) metaphor: concepts - and this seems to be the case of paternity notion in Winnicott - seem to have the permanent strength of a mountain, but they are "time in their pure state." (p. 195), that is, fruits of historic and contingents' power games.

We call ideological folds every theory that reinforces the ideological conceptions of subjectivity. Rather than deconstruct ideologies that organize and legitimize certain power games, the theories can reinforce the effects of domination that such discourses produce. We assume that "the practices and the dominant ideological discourses influence our view of reality" (Kincheloe and McLaren, 2006, p. 285). And therefore, critical theories as psychoanalysis must "help to mobilize the desire for progressive and emancipatory projects" (Kincheloe and McLaren, 2006, p. 284), as they deconstruct such practices and discourses which are sustained by the dominant ideology. When however, they act to reinforce this ideology, they act as a fold: strengthen and hidden even more the character of domination of the conceptual tools.

In the Winnicott theory, the ideological fold is characterized by some lines of force. Sometimes the father seems to be an environmental condition or his function is limited to support the child's mother; in some of the used texts the father explicitly does not have any importance for the child unless the mother has to be replaced and, in this context, the father must be very maternal. That is: a father's relationship with the child always seems secondary or reduced comparing to the relationship with the mother. In this way, there is a risk of legitimizing the relationship between the mother (biological) and the baby as the healthiest or the most "appropriate" relationship. The risk is to fail to realize that the very Winnicott's theory provides us elements to think about other family configurations —

homoaffectives or foster families, for example – whose father and mother's roles are not so strongly linked to the typical social roles or to the genders to which, generally father and mother are referred.

When opposing these contradictions in the author's work, we are following the methodology proposed by Jean Laplanche (1992) when reading Freud, that is, he used the proper analytical method to read a psychoanalytic theory. Pointing out contradictions, highlighting details, reporting defensive excesses, illuminating least recognized elements. For example, when valuing more the Winnicott that brings us the holding than the other Winnicott who reproduces the patriarchal and heteronormative ideology, we are cherishing the most committed movement with the unconscious based on the infant sexuality, therefore, less subjugated to the ideology that assumes pre-established social roles for each subject before the other. Pointing to the existence of many Winnicotts is also a way of recognizing the complexity of this author thought, once again approaching the analytical method in what he recommends: thinking of the overdetermination and in the multiple interpretations that a psychic event or culture deserves.

# Clinical Examples

We highlight three cases in which the appearances or mentions to the father become decisive for the description of the report and for the conclusions made by Winnicott (1984), in "Therapeutic Consultations in Child Psychiatry" and the text "Creativity and its origins" (1975) where Winnicott reports a clinical case passage that allows him to clarify his theory of male and female elements in the constitution of the self.

During a consultation, Bob, a 6 year-old patient, diagnosed as schizophrenic by Winnicott, draws a maze and named as the path, as he does not know the right name. In this situation, the patient leaves the room and goes to his father, telling the story of his visit to a maze, arousing anxiety in the child as he remembered. Winnicott refers to his father as an environmental failure, for not offering sufficient conditions for anchoring these child's anxieties. "In this case, the idea was of failure by the father who does not seem to have realized that a maize would touch Bob archaic anxieties" (Winnicott, 1984, p. 81).

In another of these drawings, Bob draws a ladder, referring to a real accident in which he fell down the stairs and his father, standing at the bottom, grabbed and took him to his mother, who calmed Bob while he cried. At this point, Winnicott mentions a mother's failure in the function of taking the child in her lap; his father would appear in this situation as an aid, a mother's fault correction, recovering so, the trauma suffered by Bob. This is one of the few times when Winnicott describes a situation where the father has a real action. According to Rosa (2011), the father needs "to be the real man [Italics the author] exercising concrete actions of protection, intervention and support of the family relationships and he also needs to have, effectively, presence in the children fun and games" (p. 289), a role little evidenced in the Winnicottian texts.

The father appears, in this case, as an output, albeit slow and costly from an extreme dependence of the mother. No specific role to the paternal attributes is observed, but a mother's substitution at times when she is not able to provide sufficient conditions for the child development.

According to Rosa (2011), these substitution relations, usually in the absolute dependence phase, the father must be "a surrogate mother and in this role, he should remain just as a mother, a subjective object. To perform this function, the important thing is not his masculine side, but his maternal side. "(pp. 264-265).

Faria (2014) also gives to the father an important role in the early stages of a baby's life, but as a mother substitute. The author even states that to the father this function can be costly: "... the father should be able to make use of his pure feminine element, which can be very costly in personal terms and in his masculinity." (p. 302). There where we could emphasize a capacity of holding which is independent from the gender, we found that capacity always tied to the mother figure or to a maternal attribute.

In another case, Winnicott (1984) describes the Robert consultation, a 9 year-old patient, whose father complains about his child's refusal to school and also the similarity between Robert and him

(father), which was observed by Winnicott: the attitudes of Robert, with a certain slowness tone and the superior intelligence linked the child directly to his father. Robert, besides really likes his father, he mimics him in his actions, although bothering with his father above average intelligence and says that he would like to have a "common father" (p. 102), as other children.

As he identifies with his father and has feelings of love for him; Robert, at the same time, feels hatred thanks to the unconscious desire directed to his mother, which could be also shown more clearly in situations where his father supposed intellectual superiority is highlighted alongside the other children fathers. The decisive factor in the output of this psychic conflict points to Robert positioning facing the sexes and also the genres anatomical differences. The exceeding of this conflict seems to be a result of the way the child handles these differences in identificatory terms, in this case, linked to his father, noting that the resolution of this conflict requires drawing up the ambivalence of this bond, as warns Silvia Bleichmar (2008), "it would be impossible to produce an identification to a pure rival, to a mere obstacle, without bonds of love with him." (p. 31).

Just like Bleichmar (2008) who notices the strong ambivalence of the child with his father, Galván (2014) highlights the importance of the father to accept the love led to him, "without fearing homosexual tendencies of his son and of himself" (p. 272), when addressing the Oedipal conflict with his father and his function in the integration of the true himself with the false himself. The author marks out the loan of a male power from the father that the child can internalize, identifying himself with him.

The third case is about Cecil, who was 21 months in the first consultation date. As what Winnicott (1984) names as antisocial tendency, Cecil, over the years, begins to subtract mother's things, who reports that his father was very patient with Cecil and his father's difficulty in being energetic with the child irritated her very much. Still according to the mother, the problems appeared during his father absence; since in his presence, Cecil always appealed to him and rejected her mother.

Making observations years after the contact with Cecil, Winnicott (1984) describes the importance of his father in controlling the situation, "The father has been an absolutely essential stabilizing factor in the whole situation." (p. 285). The antisocial tendency was removed and the thefts no longer happened. We must avoid here the ideological fold that links the control and the law to the father. In this case, it is clear that Winnicott himself, while the child analyst, has been used by his mother "to help with the effects of her depression on this boy" (p. 285). That is, it is not necessary to be the very father, but to have this contention capacity and to support the work of caring.

We realized that fold even in contemporary authors, who link exclusively to the role played by the father, the socialization and the integration into the culture, and to the mother the psychological characteristics. According to Martins (2014):

The dedication and the mother's devotion contribute to an inner self-esteem, as the value that the child saves internally, while the admiration coming from a present father contributes greatly to the value and self-esteem in relation to the other, to the social and to the world. "(pp. 161-162).

In "Hallucination and dehallucination", Winnicott (1957/1989), through the dream of a patient, reveals that all family members have suffered due to the abnormality of the father, and that the patient in question had to solve her difficulties with her mother firstly and afterwards she could take up the issue involving her father. In this text, a decisive role is assigned to the father, because the analyst points out that the father that he understood as abnormal reflects in the sickness of all family members. This type of text is fundamental to show how the gender does not necessarily determine the care that the adult will devote to the baby: be a depressed mother or an abnormal father, both cause impingement in the emotional development of the baby. Again, this is not a gender issue. What seems to be important is rather the kind of enabling and quiet environment for the initial development.

Serralha (2014) points out in two exposed cases, related to children aged six and seven, who were assisted by a university extension project, to the importance of the father in creating a stable and indestructible environment for the child, supporting the mother at the same time. The author attaches importance to this paternal function when relating the children aggressive and symptomatic behavior to this father failure. In the text "Appetite and emotional disorder", Winnicott (1936/1982a) attributed not

only to the mother but to the parental couple the responsibility of the first time that the child is fed as a time when, if the experience is bad, can cause eating disorders, appetite changes. When reporting cases that exemplify such disorders, the psychoanalyst points again to the father importance, in this passage, in the fantasies about the inside of the child's body. The boy taken to hospital believed that within him there was a boy, the mother became pregnant recently and Winnicott states that "It had something to do with his dad's love" (p. 115). Reeves (2013) points to an identification with the father, which will enable the boy a power of his self, which will be recovered in the puberty.

Note that the reported cases enable the deconstruction of the pair father/heterosexual man. In the examples, it is clear that what is important is the ability of an adult - man or woman - playing with the child, be able to holding and still be available to be a safe environment so that the baby can feel himself creative and willing to address his spontaneous gesture.

At this moment, we would like to resume the concepts of pure masculine and feminine elements. These concepts seem to cross many of the previously presented analysis (Faria, 2014; Rosa, 2011; Duparc, 2004). In "Creativity and its origins" (1975) Winnicott reports an excerpt of a clinical case attended by him. A man who had already gone through many years of psychotherapy, but did not feel he could leave the treatment, until the Winnicott interpretation as to what he called, in this patient, penis envy. The analyst said he was talking to a girl, and then the patient agrees intellectually:

As he said, subsequently, 'I myself could never say (knowing myself to be a man): I am a girl. I'm not mad that way. But you said it, and you have spoken to both parts of me. The madness which was mine enabled him to see himself as a girl from my position. He knows himself to be a man and never doubts that he is a man. (p.121).

The interpretation is justified by the fact that the mother of this man saw him as a girl the time he was a baby. Winnicott attempts to integrate what he calls the feminine and masculine side in his patient, by checking the attempt of coexistence of the genres in the individual formation. These sides are kept as separate and opposite, as a dissociated part of the self, that is why the pure female name.

The patient reports relief and he seems to be more integrated and ready to leave the treatment. It seems that Winnicott makes a successful intervention, but he theorizes it, he lies, again, in what we call, the ideological fold. The innatism is clear: we are born with a male and a female portion, and in illness states appears this dissociation, the female part of the patient in question, which was not integrated with the self, caused suffering.

By separating male and female pure elements, based on the notion of bisexuality and activity/passivity, Winnicott does not seem to allow the idea that men and women can, for example, perform satisfactorily the same functions related to the care of a baby and that they do not depend on the gender of the caregiver. Is it even surprising that Winnicott did not treat the patient's identification concerned with the desire of his mother to have a girl, but instead, he states that the feminine side was already in the constitution of the self.

Finally, when linking the feminine to to be and the masculine to to do, again, Winnicott contributes to the vision that constantly links the female to the passivity and the male to the activity. Although there is always the safety clause to present such elements present in men and women, the association of these terms contributes to the naturalization of genres and the allocation of corresponding social roles. Even it has the didactic character; the pure adjective seems ideologically problematic inasmuch as it reinforces the idea of a possible objectivity in relation to the definition of social roles determined by gender.

We highlight a contradictory tension in the text we are examining: at first, there is a criticism toward the objectivity, in the sense to understand that perceive the world is based on the creative impulse and this, in turn, is sustained by the transitional phenomena. The idea of purification seems to go in the opposite direction to the transitionality.

# The "Motherly Father" and Little Virile

In his article "What about father?" Winnicott (1957/1982c) highlights as the father has become a marginal issue in his theory, while the mother would be the center of all relations with the baby. In this text, the author establishes three main situations in which the father is valuable. The first of all would be a mother support function, sexually and emotionally, to help her "to feel really happy in her body and in her spirit" (p. 129). The second parent's function would be to give moral support to the mother and sustain the authority that she introduces into the child's life. Sharing the education and law rigidity with the father would be important for the mother to exercise with less weight the love and tenderness assigned solely to her. The third and last father's function is that, from his very existence and presence, the internalization of the male figure, the unique features that sets him apart from other men would be assimilated by the child. We observe, therefore, that in a text dedicated exclusively to the paternal function, Winnicott removes from the man any possibility of care. The function belongs to the woman and there is a clear contrast between masculinity and motherhood in his works, as we shall see in the following examples. To summarize these three main functions and assigning a certain prior to the importance of father to son's birth, Rosa (2014) states that the father presence is beneficial even before the child's ability to recognize him as a father, separated from the environment. While acknowledging that the father's presence is beneficial remains the problem in its approach, since once again, the father is undifferentiated from the environment, the mother is important and carries out the function of care.

In "The Effect of Psychotic Parents on the Emotional Development of the Child" (1959/2001a), a particularly important text to explain what we are calling ideological fold caused by the theory of the father in Winnicott, we have the case of Esther, whose adoptive father " seems to have become the mother of this child "(p. 103), taking on" the role of the good and idealized mother in Esther's life "(p. 105). Then he generalizes the finding as follows:

... We can separate the psychotic patients in fathers and mothers, as there are some effects that can only come from the relationship between mother and child, which is the first in which the child is involved; if there is any participation from the father, it is just as he plays the substitute-mother paper. ... Parents have their own disorders, whose effects on children can be studied; but such disorders only affect the child who is old enough to realize his father as a man. (pp. 106-7).

The above passage says a lot: after talking about Esther's father who is "always sensitive to the child's needs" (p. 103), Winnicott simply reduces this psychic ability to a kind of man mimicry in relation to the mother-woman, that is, he treats the father care which is good enough as a substitute product. After affirming the concrete presence of the father, the author's refusal again placing it as a secondary function, since the father, only when perceived as a man, will have effects on the child.

Winnicott (1960/1983) discusses the concept of the false self, in "Ego Distortion in Terms of True and False Self". By using a patient sample seen by him as a child and he was undergoing psychiatric treatment currently, he does a parenthesis to say only about the mother-daughter relationship, and he does not admit in early stages the presence of another caregiver than the mother / woman, then so determining the existence of the father as a simple mother's avatar:

I leave out infant-father relationships in this context because I am referring to early phenomena, those that concern the infant's relationship to the mother, or to the father as another mother. The father at this very early stage has not become significant as a male person. (p. 130).

In the same text, Winnicott gives us some explanation about the father's role during pregnancy. He says the mother, favorably, identified herself with her baby and enters in a peculiar state of secondary narcissism, hypochondria, enlightenment and that for this state to be kept certain environmental conditions are required - among them, the father of the child:

In the simplest case the man, supported by the social attitude which is, itself, a development from the man's natural function, deals with the external reality for the woman, and so makes it safe and sensible for her to be temporarily in-turned, self-centered. (p. 135).

Here, the father appears as the environmental condition that assists the mother and allows her to continue almost totally focused on her baby. Winnicott also states that this function is not natural to man, but an evolution. It's visible a tendency to assign the role of care to the mother and not to the father.

In the text "Autism" (1966/1996), the analyst reports the case of Sally, and states that the 17 month-year-old little girl was fine although the mother is, according to him, "inadequate, in spite of her strong wish to do well" (p. 207). Who played the maternal role was the father, "he had given the baby much of what the mother was unable to give" (p. 207). It seems that for Winnicott a motherly father is a good father, a father who resembles her mother, but the fact is that he puts the father figure once again as secondary: he appears when the mother is not good, and, at the same time, it's good that he looks like a mother. The psychoanalyst comes to wonder how this father would handle the situation when he would be required as a "male man" and "a true father" (Winnicott, 1966/1996, p. 208). It is important to note how in this text is quite clear the ideological fold we are criticizing on Winnicott work. Gender and care function are strongly linked. As if a man, a real father could not be too affectionate, worried and invested in the care directed to his baby. When appointing loving care of maternal or feminine we run the risk of distorting the father spontaneous gesture who creates and finds his baby.

#### The Father Comes After

According to Winnicott, it is only from the mother that the child's relationship with his father is allowed. For the author, it is the mother's responsibility to mediate this relationship, and out of reach of such intermediate, hardly this emotional attachment can happen. Winnicott (1957 / 1982c) says that the usefulness of the relationship between father and children does not depend on the mother, but the impingement or distortion of them are in her field of action. "As I said above, it depends greatly of what the mother decides." (p. 128).

The text "The Depressive Position in Normal Emotional Development" (1936/1982b) is permeated by the mother-infant relationship and how the mother should be able to sustain this time with the child. In addressing how the inner world of the child is built, Winnicott establishes three factors: the instinctive experience, the incorporated, retained or deleted material, and the complete relations magically introjected. The father appears only in the third situation, as one who participates indirectly as a husband or as a substitute, if necessary, to the mother.

Then, the father's importance in the depressive position would be to help the child the introjection of good material, which is able to provide enrichment and stabilizing to the baby. Remember that, for the child becomes able to internalize this material, he would have passed by other factors, mainly dependent on the mother-infant relationship. For Winnicott (1957/1982b), it is after having spent healthily by the depressive position that the child can advance to face the triangular problem of the interpersonal relationships, the Oedipus complex, which is where the father would have greater influence

So, the child's relationship with his father appears later as the first mother-infant relationship. Winnicott (1957/2005) on "Factors of Integration and Disintegration in Family Life", when addresses the family relationship, he claims that after the baby be able to distinguish from his mother, he may be able to relate himself with the mother and the father as a set. (pp. 59-60).

As already pointed out, the father will appear and will have direct influence on the child's life. In the future the child who already is related to the mother and the father will increase his social circle; in this case, his family. When he starts the school life the child will relate to the outside world, to the family, but again, the mother is largely responsible for introducing the child to the new reality in a safe way.

The text "The Child in the Family Group" (1966/2011) reiterates that the father appears first as a mother substitute and his second feature – the psychoanalyst makes it clear that it refers to the British society of the time – Is to enter into the child's life as a mother aspect, a harsh and unforgiving aspect, which penalizes. It is noticed a tendency to attribute to his father all that is on the law, on the rigidity and on the moral.

Favorably, this father will no longer be just a mother's aspect and he will become a distinct person from the mother, the person to whom the child will fear, hate, love and respect. This brief account of the psychoanalyst on the father's role makes clear that the Winnicott's paternal design, as well as the greater emphasis given to the mother, is also due to the context in which the author lived, not just a theoretical choice that would value the mother and the very primary relationship of the mother-infant pair.

In the same text, Winnicott conditions to the father the role to move the child away from the unit that he formed with the mother, so he can see objectively his mother, he can love and hate her, and then get back to her with a more energized and mature ego, then he can do the same with his father. However, in this aspect, the father can be anyone, including a person from his own family, who lives with the child and make this paper of moving him away from his mother. In other words, when we deal with the father's role, anyone can do it. As for the role of the mother, the impression is that only a woman and, preferably, the biological mother can play.

Note the clear ideological position of the author when conditioning the family structural characteristics to the presence of a mother and a father. The model is clearly heteronormative, starting with the terms mother and father, important gender markers. These markers are the result of a culture and an era, as Winnicott himself admits.

From an analytical point of view and also to monitor the political critique we are doing to the way in Winnicott's theory the heteronormative family is taken as a rule, would it not be interesting to rethink the use of these theoretical terms? Why not caring adults, holding adults or other term that effectively point to what interests from the point of view of the emotional development possibility conditions? The development of the theory can benefit from changes in the family settings, inserting these conceptual changes and giving new conditions for constant updating required in psychoanalytic practice. If, in the context of Winnicott theoretical production, the family model was quite hard, currently we deal with multiple family structures, which should be welcomed by the theory.

Turning clearly with the preponderance in the analysis of the father's role in childhood and especially in the first years of life, we do not ignore his importance in other phases. Authors such as Fonseca (2014) and Hammoud (2014) point to the influence of fathers in adolescence crossing towards the assumption of adults conflict, aimed at maturity, plus the ability to lend his person to the identification of the child with an adult male figure. Anyway, we still observe in this approach, the consistency assigned in a privileged way to the man as this identificatory and support figure for the teen, devaluing any other person who assumes this symbolic function.

Overall, we believe that placing the father always at a later time in the emotional development of the baby contributes immensely to repress what we have seen as a picture of a motherly father. In the Winnicott work, they are two clear movements and both help each other: emasculate the father who cares for and invigorate the maximum the man / father figure, always putting it as a support to the mother and always leaving it to a secondary time. These two theoretical movements are strongly committed to what we think is the ideology that underlies the heteronormative family.

## **Final Considerations**

The Winnicott's conception of a father and his influence in the child's psychic life has not remained the same throughout his work. In addition to considering the context in which these statements were made, we must also qualify the entire relationship attributed to the mother, as a mediator of the baby relationship with his father.

Our criticism to the patriarchal and heteronormative ideology presence in the Winnicott work (and in the psychoanalysis as a whole) can be interpreted, according to Winnicott, as an attempt to transform the

practice and the author's theory as a potential space, from which new creative forms of welcoming the human infant may be possible. The question we raised is, in short: why call maternal a function that can be approximated of what Winnicott himself called concern, handling and also holding? From a theoretical point of view, the spontaneous gesture of the father is rejected by the theory. In general, the theory acts as opposed to a good enough mother: it is just as false self, in the case, as a mother, and then the father may appear. The theory, as opposed to this position, should welcome these adults deflating these labels (father, mother, male, female, man, woman), mainly what they produce of plastered affective, the opposite of any spontaneity.

It seems to us, there is no questioning by the psychoanalytic theory in general, as the convergence of biological sex with the gender, from the male to the man and the female for the woman. On the contrary, it seems to be part of the history of the psychoanalytic theory this linkage. However, this same theory has shown that not only the biological father and mother, but other adults can take care of the functions and the subjective constitution of a baby. You can discuss this convergence between gender and biological sex remembering that, any adult, regardless its biological sex or gender, can have a good enough care, can enable the holding and create a healthy environment for the child, of "softness, tenderness" (Winnicott, 1957/1982c, p. 128). This same adult may also represent the law and the order of the prohibition and of the castration. There is no reason for these functions are attached to the adult gender or to the biological sex who is in charge of the care task. And there is no reason to believe that these functions do not move in the same person and among the people who care for the child.

Loparic (2014) also points to the possibility that the father takes these tender features with his child. By analyzing the design of the father in Freud and Melanie Klein, he states that unlike these privileged interlocutors, the father in the Winnicott work not only punish, but can also understand and forgive.

It is noted a relativism in this matter in the very Winnicott work, which does not constitute a change of direction, but the author feels, at times, that the father can take the role of mother and vice versa. This relativity, however, occurs primarily on exceptional terms, where the absence of these fathers is imposed by the death or other undesirable situations. Although rare, Winnicott says, clearly, that the maternal characteristics may be present in the father – see the Sally case (1966/1997), as he takes that maternal attribution and so he is considered a good father. Although this exchange of features is thought by the author as a possibility, Winnicott does not cease to wonder about the time that this motherly father would have to be a man, one of the functions assigned to the father in Winnicott's work. After the child's approach to the father, there is a tendency to no traffic or dialogue between the austere features, the law and the tender, which are attributed to the mother, masculine and female traits, and a position that should be criticized and relativized in these relationships.

Dias (2014) in his text "Father, Parental Identification and Male Homosexuality" shows the father's role in the constitution of the child's sexual identity and makes a journey to the Winnicott work, advancing in the gaps left by the author on the subject. In any case, we paid attention here to the path quote from Winnicott's thinking on the maturity from two main vectors, the instinctual and the identity, observing, however, that the instinctual root in this work has strong biological connotation. According to the author, Winnicott gives greater importance to the needs of the instinctual life in the development of the infantile sexuality, believing in the importance of a himself with a personal identity strongly built, as opposed to a situation where the root identity would be a broader role in the sexuality development, thus bringing aspects of those who care for the constitution of his maturation.

In line with previous researches, we reaffirm the role of the otherness in the subjectivity constitution and on the other contents for insertion into the culture and to the psychological development of any subject. This naturalization, to some extent, in the Winnicott formulations does not allow us to overcome the moral concreteness contained in the consonance of the paternal function with a father who is a man biologically and it also paralyzes the child's relations with whoever effectively care him.

Reeves (2013) considers the Winnicott theoretical targeting as a "matter of choosing a focus than to express a conviction on the relative importance that led him to concentrate primarily on the role and the mother's function in the child's education" (p. 359).

With André (1996) and Bleichmar (2008) contributions, we argue that it is not exactly a theoretical choice. We can realize in Winnicott the influence of a psychoanalytic heritage, which tends to give to the father the rational part, stating that the child must learn to fear, love and respect his father. These characteristics are also in the English society context in which the author formulates his theses, but coexisting in his writing, then we can point to a repression of the theory, which according to André (1996):

... It would not be too hard to find, except minor differences, in the writings of one or another of our contemporaries. But the times have changed a lot.... If persists the "prejudice", it's because it drinks in a source other than the "climate of the time: the castration anxiety (and its correlate, the *horror feminae*), which, in turn, largely exceeded the "fin de siècle". (Footnote 57, pp. 52-53).

If Jacques André makes this critique to the Freudian position on the female superego weakness, we can transpose that analysis to the Winnicott texts, from the hypothesis, based on the unconscious, of the passivity repression and other care attributes in the father figure and in the naturalization of the maternal instinct. The tendency to discharge these functions leads to a plastered of the positions: father as a male figure and mother as a mother figure. Phrases such as "the father is the embodiment of the law and the order that the mother introduces in the child world" (Duparc, 2004, p. 91) are repeated to exhaustion.

André researches (1996) point to a passivity repression in much of the psychoanalytic theory. This repression has its return in the form of two major theoretical constructs in Winnicott: the lack of care capacity in the father and a naturalization of this ability tied to the motherhood, under the form of a maternal instinct in the woman. Just by the preponderance given to the maternal cares and the subaltern place reserved for the father's role in the care of infants and children, the theoretical cut in Winnicott's theory is justified. As we have seen throughout this article, the father is largely laid out from the mother-child scene and, when he presented himself in the place reserved ideologically to the female or mother is, so to speak, reprimanded by the author. On the other hand, the woman who becomes a mother is called to occupy a mental state such that often has the impression that she can only play his role thanks to a kind of typical woman's instinctive scheme, often having its origin in the pregnancy.

In the case of the paternal function in Winnicott, we could not even point it as repressing, since, in fact, it is a repressed function. Making to work the father's place in the Winnicott's theory is fundamental. We believe there are elements in this same theory to show that being a father also depends on the development factors and on the psychic work. We defend the idea that the fatherhood can be a potential function as it is in the motherhood. Maybe it is important to point to the transitional nature of the relationship which an adult (man or woman) down with a baby. If, on the one hand, we are aware of the heavy weight of the ideology of gender which is marking these papers, we also bet on specific, potential and uniquely creative arrangements that each adult will establish with his baby.

In this regard, the new family arrangements, less heteronormative, form a spectacular field of research through which we can avoid what seems an ideological fold in Winnicott's theory about the father. The purpose of these future researches is to deflate the importance of terms such as maternal and paternal, and point to concepts that seem clinically and theoretically more relevant from a psychoanalytic point of view: care, holding, concern. To accomplish this task, it is essential to disrupt terms like father, hardness, law, rationality and man; and on the other hand, to unleash terms like mother, concern, affection, woman, care. We understand that clinical interventions based on this premise will allow for greater creativity and transitionality of the relationship that men and women can establish with a baby.

#### References

- André, J. (1996). As origens femininas da sexualidade. (V. Ribeiro, Trad.). Rio de Janeiro: Jorge Zahar.
- Bleichmar, S. (2008). Paradojas de la constitución sexual masculina. In S. Bleichmar. *Paradojas de La Sexualidad Masculina* (pp.13-40). Buenos Aires: Paidós.
- Deleuze, G. (1992). *Conversações*. (Peter Pál Pelbart, Trad.). São Paulo: 34.
- Dethiville, L. (2014). O pai suficientemente simbólico. In C. Rosa. (Org.). *E o pai? Uma abordagem winnicottiana* (pp. 93-106). São Paulo: DWW Editorial.
- Dias, E. (2014). Pai, identificação parental e homossexualidade masculina. In C. Rosa. (Org.). E o pai? Uma abordagem winnicottiana (pp. 233-264). São Paulo: DWW Editorial.
- Duparc, F. (2004). Le père chez Winnicott (est-il "suffisamment bon"?). In J. Boushira, J. et M. Durieux. *Winnicott insolite* (pp.71-91). Paris: PUF.
- Faria, F. (2014). O lugar do pai no contexto da regressão clinica. In C. Rosa. (Org.). *E o pai? Uma abordagem winnicottiana* (pp. 301-318). São Paulo: DWW Editorial.
- Fonseca, M. (2014). O desmoronamento da rocha firme: um caso de impotência sexual. In C. Rosa. (Org.). *E o pai? Uma abordagem winnicottiana* (pp. 291-230). São Paulo: DWW Editorial.
- Galván, G. (2014). O pai e a problemática do falso si-mesmo em um contexto edípico. In C. Rosa. (Org.) *E o pai? Uma abordagem winnicottiana* (pp.265-274). São Paulo: DWW Editorial.
- Hammoud, T. (2014). Da adolescência para o mundo: o pai no caso Frederico. In C. Rosa. (Org.). *E o pai? Uma abordagem winnicottiana* (pp. 275-290). São Paulo: DWW Editorial.
- Kincheloe, J. & McLaren, P. (2006). Repensando a teoria crítica e a pesquisa qualitativa. In. N. Denzin & Y. Lincoln. O planejamento da pesquisa qualitativa: teorias e abordagens (pp. 281-313). 2.ed. (Sandra Netz, Trad.). Porto Alegre: Artmed.
- Laplanche, J. (1992) Interpréter [avec] Freud. J. Laplanche. *La révolution copernicienne inachevée* (pp. 21-36). Paris: Aubier.
- Loparic, C. (2014). O pai e o monoteísmo em Winnicott. In C. Rosa. (Org.). *E o pai? Uma abordagem winnicottiana* (pp. 63-91). São Paulo: DWW Editorial.
- Martins, A. (2014). Reflexões sobre as funções do pai na inserção da criança na realidade partilhada a partir de Winnicott. In C. Rosa. (Org.). E o pai? Uma abordagem winnicottiana. (pp. 141-162). São Paulo: DWW Editorial.
- Reeves, C. (2013). On the margins: the role of the father. In J. Abram. (Ed.). *Donald Winnicott today*. London: Routledge.
- Rosa, C. (2011). O papel do pai no processo de amadurecimento em Winnicott. In E. Dias & Z. Loparic. Winnicott na escola de São Paulo (pp.257-302). São Paulo: DWW Editorial.

- Rosa, C. (2014). O pai em Winnicott. In C. Rosa. (Org.). *E o pai? Uma abordagem winnicottiana* (pp. 25-62). São Paulo: DWW Editorial.
- Serralha, C. (2014). A criança agressiva e o pai. In C. Rosa. (Org.). E o pai? Uma abordagem winnicottiana. (pp. 271-231). São Paulo: DWW Editorial.
- Winnicott, D. (1975). A criatividade e suas origens. In D. Winnicott. O Brincar e a Realidade. (J. O. Aguiar Abreu & V. Nobre, Trads.). (pp. 108-139). Rio De Janeiro: Imago.
- Winnicott, D. (1982a). Apetite e perturbação emocional. In D. Winnicott. Textos selecionados: da pediatria à psicanálise (pp.111-137). (2ª. Ed). (J. Russo, Trad.). Rio de Janeiro: F. Alves. (Trabalho original publicado em 1936).
- Winnicott, D. (1982b). A posição depressiva no desenvolvimento emocional normal. In D. W. Textos selecionados: da pediatria à psicanálise (pp.437-458). 2a ed. (J. Russo, Trad.). Rio de Janeiro: F. Alves. (Trabalho original publicado em 1936).
- Winnicott, D. (1982c). E o pai?. In D. Winnicott. *A criança e o seu mundo* (pp.127-133). 6a ed. (A. Cabral, Trad.). Rio de Janeiro: Livros Técnicos e Científicos. (Trabalho original publicado em 1957).
- Winnicott, D. (1983b). Distorção do ego em termos de falso e verdadeiro self. In D. Winnicott. O ambiente e os processos de maturação: estudos sobre a teoria do desenvolvimento emocional (pp.128-139). (I. C. S. Ortiz, Trad.). Porto Alegre: Artes Médicas. (Trabalho original publicado em 1960).
- Winnicott, D. (1984). Consultas terapêuticas em psiquiatria infantil. (J. M. X. Cinha, Trad.). Rio de Janeiro: Imago.
- Winnicott, D. (1989). Hallucination and dehallucination. In D. Winnicott. Psycho-Analytic explorations (pp.39-42). Cambridge: Harvard University Press. (Trabalho original publicado em 1957).
- Winnicott, D. (1997). Autism. In R. Shepherd, J. Johns, & H. T. Robinson. (Eds.). *Thinking about children* (pp.197-217). Boston: Da Capo. (Trabalho original publicado em 1966).
- Winnicott, D. (2001a). Consequências da psicose parental para o desenvolvimento emocional da criança. In D. Winnicott. A família e o desenvolvimento individual (pp.101-114). 3a ed. (M. B. Cipolla, Trad.). São Paulo: Martins Fontes. (Trabalho original publicado em 1959).
- Winnicott, D. (2001b). Fatores de integração e desintegração na vida familiar. In D. Winnicott. A família e o desenvolvimento individual (pp.59-72). 3a ed. (M. B. Cipolla, Trad.). São Paulo: Martins Fontes. (Trabalho original publicado em 1957).
- Winnicott, D. (2002a). A mãe dedicada comum. In D. Winnicott. Os bebês e suas mães (pp.1-12). (J. L. Camargo, Trad.). São Paulo: Martins Fontes. (Trabalho original publicado em 1966).
- Winnicott, D. (2011). A criança no grupo familiar. In D. Winnicott. *Tudo começa em casa* (pp.123-144). (P. C. Sandler, Trad.). São Paulo: WMF Martins Fontes. (Trabalho original publicado em 1966).

Received: June 28, 2014 Approved: Apr. 23, 2015

Fábio Roberto Rodrigues Belo: Doctor in Literary Studies, associate professor in the Department of Psychology at the Faculty of Philosophy and Human Sciences, Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais, Brasil.

Marcela Rêda Guimarães: PPG Master Degree student, CAPES Scholar, Department of Psychology, Faculty of Philosophy and Human Sciences, Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais, Brasil.

Kaio Adriano Batista Fidelis: Graduated student in Psychology, Department of Psychology, Faculty of Philosophy and Human Sciences, Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais, Brasil.