
Psychic Implications in Phonological Disorder Analyzed Through Fairy Tales

Taís Cervi¹

Universidade Federal de Santa Maria, Santa Maria-RS, Brasil

Marcia Keske-Soares

Universidade Federal de Santa Maria, Santa Maria-RS, Brasil

Angela Maria Schneider Drügg

Universidade Regional do Noroeste do Estado do Rio Grande do Sul, Ijuí-RS, Brasil

Abstract. This research analyzed the relationship between phonological disorder and the mental issues involved in this pathology, as well as how the children stood before such symptom. Phonological disorder is a speech abnormality characterized by inappropriate use of phonemes and absence of identifiable organic factors. Its greatest occurrence is observed between the ages of 4 and 8 years old. The aim of this study was to analyze the refractory position and other psychological aspects in children with phonological disorders through fairy tales. A qualitative methodology based on content analysis was applied. This study counted with the participation of 10 children of both sexes, aged between 4 and 7 years and 11 months old, diagnosed with phonological disorders and referred to the speech therapy department of a higher education institution. The instrument for data collection was fairy tales. Data was generalized and grouped into thematic categories and showed that all children of the study were refractory in relation to linguistic conventions due to a difficulty to leave the period of relative dependence towards independence, thus developing a speech symptom.

Keywords: Speech disorders; psychic symptoms; narration.

Implicações Psíquicas no Desvio Fonológico Analisadas por Meio dos Contos de Fadas

Resumo. Nesta pesquisa analisou-se a relação entre o desvio fonológico e as questões psíquicas envolvidas nessa patologia e a forma como as crianças se posicionaram diante de tal sintoma. O desvio fonológico é uma alteração da fala, com uso inadequado de fonemas e ausência de fatores orgânicos identificáveis. Sua maior ocorrência é constatada entre quatro e oito anos de idade. O objetivo deste estudo foi analisar a posição refratária e outros aspectos psicológicos em crianças com desvio fonológico por meio dos contos de fadas. Empregou-se uma metodologia qualitativa, a partir da análise de conteúdo. Participaram da pesquisa dez crianças, de ambos os sexos, na faixa etária de quatro anos a sete anos e 11 meses, diagnosticadas com desvio fonológico e encaminhadas ao serviço de atendimento fonoaudiológico de uma instituição de ensino superior. Para a coleta de dados, o instrumento utilizado foi os contos de fadas. Os dados foram generalizados e agrupados em categorias temáticas e apontaram que todas as crianças da pesquisa eram refratárias à convenção linguística em virtude de uma dificuldade de sair do período de dependência relativa para a independência, desenvolvendo assim um sintoma de linguagem.

Palavras-chave: Distúrbios da fala; sintomas psíquicos; narração.

¹ E-mail: taiscervi@hotmail.com

Implicaciones Psicológicas en el Trastorno Fonológico Analizadas Mediante los Cuentos de Hadas

Resumen. En esta investigación se examinó la relación entre el trastorno fonológico y las cuestiones psíquicas implicadas en esta patología y la forma cómo los niños se posicionaron frente al síntoma. El trastorno fonológico es una alteración del habla, con el uso inadecuado de los fonemas y la ausencia de factores orgánicos identificables. Se observa su mayor ocurrencia entre los 4 y 8 años de edad. El objetivo de este estudio fue analizar la posición refractaria y otros aspectos psicológicos en niños con trastornos fonológicos mediante los cuentos de hadas. Se aplicó una metodología cualitativa a partir del análisis de contenido. Participaron en el estudio diez niños, de ambos sexos, en la franja de edad de 4 años a 7 años y 11 meses, diagnosticados con trastornos fonológicos y encaminados al servicio de atención fonoaudiológica de una institución de educación superior. El instrumento utilizado para la recolección de los datos fue el cuento de hadas. Los datos fueron generalizados y agrupados en categorías temáticas y mostraron que todos los niños del estudio eran refractarios a la convención lingüística debido a una dificultad para salir del período de la dependencia relativa para el de la independencia, desarrollando de este modo un síntoma de lenguaje.

Palabras clave: Trastornos del habla; síntomas psíquicos; narración.

The present article is fruit of reflections on what psychic issues a speech symptom could be hiding and on the way that the child stands before such symptom. As a result, the objective of this study is to analyze, through fairy tales, the refractory position and other psychological aspects that affect children with phonological disorder.

Differently from what happens in the biological sciences, in which the patient's symptom is considered only from a pathological perspective (as opposed to normal) and his or her story is investigated with the aim of circumscribing only the origin of the nonfunctioning (or of the malfunctioning) speech, in Psychoanalysis the symptom is addressed to the analyst and is not established by regulations or conventions. A symptom only begins to make sense from the moment when it produces unease in the subject causing him or her to perform a questioning movement.

It is only from this psychoanalytical conception of symptom that it is possible to listen beyond the pure error. To take a conception of symptom circumscribed by Psychoanalysis is fundamental for contextualizing the practice of listening to the patient who stumbles in speech and situating from what place one should consider somebody who comes to the clinical professional with a speech-related suffering (Bender & Surreaux, 2011). It is through the use of the clinical-theoretical framework of Psychoanalysis that the therapist can realize how much the child is or is not implicated in his or her symptom and whether he or she makes or does not make moves for it to take another way.

The speech pathology to be considered in this research is phonological disorder, also known in the literature as articulation disorder or developmental articulation disorder (Santana, Machado, Bianchi, Freitas & Marques, 2010), being defined as a type of speech abnormality characterized as a difficulty of speech due to inadequate use of phonemes, occurring mostly in children aged between 4 and 8 years old (Wertzner, 2004). Such children do not present identifiable organic factors (hearing impairment or anatomical and functional abnormalities) that might interfere with their speech. In addition, a diagnosis is only possible when children are older than 4 years old (Grunwell, 1990), given that before so speech disorganization is to be expected, as they are going through a language acquisition phase. Its etiology is still unknown, although some studies reference to the family nucleus as a possible factor of influence (Pereira, Keske-Soares, 2008; Pagliarin, Keske-Soares & Mota, 2009).

In terms of reactions concerning a proposition of change in speech patterns of children, there are variations among children who take on an attitude of change and others that resist to it, being the latter known as refractory in relation to changes (Benine, 2001).

The research considered the hypothesis that children diagnosed with phonological disorder would be presenting a refractory position in relation to changes in speech patterns. This position would be being assumed by the child as a response to a difficulty to leave the period of relative dependence in relation to the maternal role and to walk towards independence (Winnicott, 1983/2007) and thus to try to satisfy the maternal desire to keep the child in an infantilized position. This makes the child produce

a symptomatic manifestation – the phonological disorder – and not to care about being or not being comprehended by others.

Given the degree of precocity of a child's organic functions at birth, he or she needs another similar one that performs the double function in the beginning of life: the care necessary for organic survival and symbolic care through attributions of meanings and significations in relation to his or her manifestations (gestures and crying, for instance), being inserted into the field of the Other (initially represented by the maternal role). The child is then gradually anticipated, spoken about in the discourse of parents even before being born, because they imagine how he or she will be, like whom he or she will look, etc., putting him or her in a condition of dependence in relation to the Other (Gurski, 2010).

This dependence in a first moment of psychic constitution causes children to assume a place where they are their mothers' object of desire. The problem children encounter from then on is about responding to this maternal desire or not. So that this matter takes its place in a second moment, it is necessary that the role of the father is acknowledged by both mother and child so he can intervene in this dual relationship, which will allow the mother, little by little, to address her desire to other tasks and also to people other than her child. When this first recording of the paternal role exists but does not perform the task satisfactorily something needs to emerge in this gap: oftentimes a symptom (Laznik, 2013). And why not a speech symptom?

The symptomatic manifestations of childhood are produced as a response to parental demand, fulfilling a role of bond between the child's body and those who surround him or her (family, school...). From this perspective, the child's symptom has a double character, since it emerges as real in his or her own body and at the same time as belonging to the field of parental roles. In this way, the clinical symptom seems to have the property of making one listen to it at the same time that it presents itself as a coded message that has parents as the certain address (Ferrari, 2012).

To observe these aspects in the discourse of the child classic fairy tales have been chosen as instruments. Telling stories to children is a quite ordinary activity in the most diverse cultures around the world and in a variety of situations. As it is known, this practice has been reproduced throughout the times in a nearly-intuitive manner. Actually, most of them had been circulating orally for hundreds of years. Appealing to the awakening of feelings of identification, love, hatred, envy, fear, etc., tales carry the ideal of the Other – the one who represents the law, the rules, and the moral and, therefore, demands something from the child. For this reason, they keep awakening his or her interest (Jerusalinsky, 2011).

Fairy tales can provide children with a greater clarity in their affective universe, helping them to recognize, even if unconsciously, some of their problems, and offering them perspectives of solutions, even if temporary. Narratives are means that enable one to act in face of the stalemates of psychic constitution (Bettelheim, 1980). Thus, fairy tales are a precious and pleasant way to access psychic questions related to phonological disorder.

Method

Study design

This research has an exploratory character and qualitative approach and is based on the Content Analysis proposed by Minayo (2010), through which nuclei of meaning from the communications were observed for analytical purposes.

Participants

A total of 10 children and 4 judges participated in the research. About the children, for them to participate in the research they should be aged between 4 and 7 years and 11 months old, be diagnosed with phonological disorder and be referred to the speech assistance service of a higher

education institution, and be on the waiting list of the service. Also, they needed to consent to the signing of the informed consent form.

As for the judges, they were also masters, being 2 Speech Therapy specialists (one makes use of the clinical-theoretical framework of Psychology; the other one does not do so) and 2 Psychology specialists (one makes use of the clinical-theoretical framework of Psychology; the other one does not do so). They aimed to identify whether the child was or was not assuming a refractory position. They received orientations as to the objectives and procedures of the research through the informed consent form. In addition, they were informed about their data analysis task. After clarifications and the signing of the informed consent form, the material was handed in.

Instruments

The instruments used for data collection were books of classic children's stories. They were: Little Red Riding Hood, The Three Little Pigs, Jack and the Beanstalk, Snow White (by Editora Todo Livro); and Pinocchio, Sleeping Beauty, Aladdin and The Wonderful Lamp (by Editora Libris). Data was collected by means of an assessment situation in which the tales chosen by the children were read to them or, in case they were literate and wanted to read, they did so themselves. Then they were engaged in a dialogue lasting approximately an hour, during single individual meetings recorded with a digital camera for further transcription and analysis.

Procedures

The analysis of the material was guided by the Content Analysis method, in accordance with Minayo (2010, which consists of discovering nuclei of meaning from a communication. After the material was fully transcribed by the researcher, the first stage of the analysis (pre-analysis) consisted of the reading of the transcriptions for overall assessment. The obtained data was arranged in tables distributed as follows: reference to the part that the subjects liked the most and the least of each tale; the subjects' reactions when questioned about some word that was not comprehended by the researcher, and analyzes by the judges. Later, the material began to be explored through data analysis, with the establishment of categories and verification of subjective questions that could be related to refractory position. For analysis purposes, each book became a category, totaling seven, and in each category three points were analyzed: (1) part of the tale that the child liked the most; (2) part of the tale that the child liked the least and (3) the child's reaction when questioned about some word that had not been comprehended. The analysis was carried out by the researcher and, in addition, the position of the judges before the identification, or absence of it, of the refractory position in the children was taken into consideration. As the last stage, data was interpreted based on the theoretical foundation and on the guiding assumptions of the investigation.

Ethical considerations

This study complied with the ethical assumptions of researches involving humans, being, for this reason, sent to the Ethics Research Committee of the Higher Education Institution, which issued favorable legal opinion on March 2nd, 2013, under No. 12636713.6.0000.5346.

Results and Discussion

According to the proposal of the content analysis, the data will be pointed below through thematic categories obtained by a categorization process. In the categories the data will be presented and illustrated mainly through the questions to which the tales gave rise and, whenever possible, through some of the children's speeches. The data will be discussed and theoretically based in accordance with psychoanalytical assumptions.

Category 1 – Little Red Riding Hood

The threat of being eaten up is the main theme of the tale “Little Red Riding Hood”. The story was used by all the 10 children involved in the research. The elements that allowed thinking about the refractory position assumed by the children in this tale derived from the questions: “What is the part you liked the least in the Little Red Riding Hood story?” and “What is the part you liked the most in the Little Red Riding Hood story?”

Out of the 9 children that answered the questions, 5 answered that they did not like when the big bad wolf wanted to eat up Little Red Riding Hood, and 3 children said that they did not like when Little Red Riding Hood said goodbye to her mother. When questioned about their favorite part of the story, most of them highlighted the moment when the big bad wolf was killed by the woodcutter, which corresponds to the last part of the tale. All passages referred to in the answers of the children to the question about the part that they liked the most and the least of the Little Red Riding Hood story suggest that they have served as metaphors that symbolized the difficulty of the break with the ties with the maternal role.

This moment of dependence, of symbiosis with the maternal role, has to do with a first moment of the child’s subjective constitution – alienation –, when he or she is tied to the maternal discourse and, for this reason, is the mother’s object of desire. There need to be, however, a cut in this relationship so that the child does not satisfy all of his or her mother’s desire (Kamers & Baratto, 2004). This will make the child to move towards his or her desires, including towards the desire to speak, entering the second moment of constitution: separation. The agent that causes this interdiction is the paternal role, which will make the mother remember that the child is a subject different from her and of whom she is not the absolute owner (Bernardino, 2008).

It is for this exact purpose that a wolf appears on the child’s way, because it definitively is the wild version of domestic danger, a proof that the good daddy at home may become a threatening and fearsome figure and, therefore, interdictor of desires (Corso & Corso, 2006). After all, “*the wolf was inside the little house*” and, therefore, lives in our houses.

The father emerges as the third indispensable party so that the child elaborates the loss of the initial relationship with the mother, representing the beginning of reality and of order in the family, causing the child to realize that he or she is no longer the only one holding the mother’s attention.

To be a father is a task that introduces a third element that destabilizes a dual idyll, giving rise to absence, to desire and to a subject where once there used to be completeness and an object. The father needs to act as the facilitator of separations, encouraging his child to follow his or her own way, offering himself as an important and fundamental element for identification, which was once a role exclusive to the mother (Saraiva, Reinhardt & Souza, 2012). The more profoundly the child surrender himself or herself to living the role of object of maternal desire, the lesser he or she will know where his or her limits are, the borders that point where the other starts and the self begins.

Category 2 – The Three Little Pigs

The “Three Little Pigs” story, though it has a simple plot, touches children deeply, because one of its relevant themes is separation. After all, one day they will have to move away from their mothers, to leave their houses and to protect themselves all alone. The three little pigs would make room for the development of the child, representing successive moments of constitution. Initially unprotected, at risk of being devoured, the little pig and the child learn to create obstacles that separate them from their mothers and that constitute them as subjects that possess their own desires (Corso & Corso, 2006).

This separation process that the child goes through is a progressive work quite marked by strategies that give a support to this moment. It is necessary that the maternal role supports these strategic plans of the child as well. It was possible to observe in the research, however, through some of the speeches of the children during this tale, that the one performing the maternal role has some difficulty giving support to this separation, which causes the child to assume a refractory position regarding speaking according to linguistic rules. In general, the children showed some concern about

the emotional state of the little pigs' mother: "*ela ficou triste porque eles vão sair pá fazê uma casa pa eles*"; "*ela ficou soando*"; "*ela tava sentindo saudade dos filhos*"; "*ela ficou triste porque eles iam moá sozinhos*". [she got sad because they are going away to build a house for them"; "she cried"; "she missed her kids"; "she got sad because they were going to live alone"].

Moreover, among the 8 children that used this tale 6 said that the part that they liked the least was when the little pigs left their home. It is believed that moving out of home is a metaphor that effectively represents the separation between mother and child, and those successive walls, increasingly solid, need to be built in order to demarcate the territories in between child and adult. In this way, it is possible to identify the refractory position, since the latter, among other questions, refers to the difficulty in setting oneself free from maternal dependence.

The research data identified that the moment when the wolf fell inside the pot with boiling water was referred to by 6 children as their favorite part of the tale. This also reveals aspects of the refractory position assumed by the children, because the wolf represents the interdictor in the mother/child relationship, establishing a prohibition, a castration. In this sense, both the fact of leaving home and the episode the wolf falls inside the pot with boiling water have to do with the refractory position of the child and with the difficulty to deal with the absence, with the castration.

Dolto (1992) defines castration as a prohibition that opposes to a satisfaction once known but that should be overcome, displaced. In this way, children go through different prohibitions in the course of their development that will lead them to the condition of access to a subjective autonomy. However, this castration needs to be understood by the mother. Being a mother means admitting the presence on a faltering land of incompleteness.

Moving out of home is the first movement of a child's independence and one of the important castrations (oral castration, according to Dolto) that he or she goes through, because leaving home equals the frustration of weaning, when the child assumes two important forms of representation for growth: the substitution of passiveness for activity and the separation between the mother's and the child's desire.

It is this oral deprivation that paves the way to the emergence of verbal communication, in which the maternal role guides the child's phonemes until they are perfectly presented according to the maternal language. Perhaps what happens to these subjects that manifest a speech symptom is that the speech desired by the mother is that which puts them in a position of desubjectivation, in a childish position. The child is left with no other alternative but defending himself or herself from this by producing a symptom and assuming a refractory position.

Category 3 – Jack and the Beanstalk

The tale "Jack and the Beanstalk" was chosen by 6 children. Its beginning refers to an operation of detachment from the mother and from her condition of feeder because, shaken by the anger after discovering that Jack had exchanged the cow for Magic Beans, she orders that he goes to bed hungry.

It is worth considering here a few words about the business that Jack makes – the exchange of something certain (the cow Milky White) for something doubtful (the Magic Beans). What becomes apparent in this exchange is the perfect representation to allude to weaning, that is, a business at first not profitable at all, in which the everyday milk that is certain is exchanged for something impalpable and uncertain. The fact is that for one to grow up he or she needs to leave home and lose the advantages of being little, including the milk from the maternal breasts (Corso & Corso, 2006). In this way, the resulting exchange would be as follows: Jack gives up on that which used to give him milk but has dried up, and receives a few seeds whose magic would be growth. It is possible to think that this metaphor would be representing the difficulty in the separation between mother and child, which was referred to by 3 out of the 6 children that used the tale as being the part that they liked the least.

In psychic terms, it is considered that if for a woman the man represented everything to her, there would not be a desire for maternity, and if the child was everything to a mother, she would have no reasons to be interested in a man. In the case of the tale, for what reason the giantess would stay with her giant, meeting all of his needs, if, at some point, a child that awoke her maternal desire did not appear?

Moreover, under her servility appearance, the giantess proved very unfaithful to her husband, because she warns Jack about the danger he is in and even hides him in the closet (Corso & Corso, 2006), an aspect that refers to maternal protection. Realizing that, 1 child answered that the part he/she liked the most in the story was when “*ela escondeu João no armário*” [she (giantess) hid Jack in the closet], and another child emphasizes that he/she liked “*quando a mulher do gigante dá dinheiro pro João e ele sai correndo*” [when the giant’s wife gives Jack money and he runs away], thus being able, with the money, to meet his need for eating. It is possible to think that the monster, in this case the giantess, also constitutes a possibility of metaphorical substitution of the danger of being swallowed up by the mother, that is, of being incorporated by the mother’s desire, which makes the child stay in a refractory position, because being engulfed by this figure may be, until a certain point, pleasant, as it satisfies the maternal desire.

It is at the end of the Beanstalk where the giant can be found, the representation of the tyrannical father who has many possessions but does not share with anybody and also has a wife to serve him. This is the father who “*owns the place*”, including the mother (Corso & Corso, 2006) and who, for this reason, leads 2 children to point this moment as the part of the story they liked the least.

This relationship of the giant (man) with Jack (son) is the root that reveals to children that in their relationship with their mothers, at a certain moment, an interdictor comes in – represented in the tale by the giant –, who by means of his desire to eat up the boy shows that there is place for only one in this relationship, the other one must be devoured, eliminated. In this way, the moment when Jack cuts off the Beanstalk becomes a representative way to run away from this, according to the opinion of 3 children of the research.

Category 4 – Snow White

“Snow White is one of the narratives that the little ones liked the most. In the research, the tale was used by half (5) of the children. It brings in its plot the matter of the passage to sexuality: dying as a child and waking up as an adult. This transition that children are faced with reports a conflict of the little ones regarding their parents’ evasive answers. This allows children to become autonomous little by little in face of their parents’ speech and thinking, putting their desire in evidence.

Biting the apple means dying as a child and waking up as a man or a woman, when the poison is sexuality. This is what the witch went to do at the dwarves’ house. In the story she goes there to kill the girl; in reality, this is about awakening the child to desires and temptations. So much so that it is under the effect of the poisoned apple that Snow White’s beauty is exposed, becoming available to the eyes of the prince, that is, a space is opened for her to go after desires other than the maternal one (Corso & Corso, 2006).

If biting the apple represents the transition to becoming an adult, it is possible to understand the reason why 30% of the children who read the tale Snow White referred to the episode when the witch poisons the princess as the part of the story that they liked the least. The witch of this and of so many other stories is there to incarnate the figure of the mother, which at times is beautiful, at times is horrible: “*é uma bela hólivel buxa*” [she is a beautiful horrible witch]. The character shows the exact side of the mother that tries to keep the child as her constant object of desire. And the children, unconsciously, know that. The evil witch knows of the power of the child, perceives in her the adult that she will become and attempts to prevent the transformation, holding her in childhood, in a time when she is subject to her power. The witch knows of the power of the child so much that “*... a Banca de Neve moleu... daí a buxa pegou o poder da pincesa. Daí a buxa colocou o poder da pincesa junto com o dela que era hólivel*”. [...Snow White died... then the witch got the princess’ power. Then the witch put the princess’ power together with hers that was horrible].

To be poisoned would mean to grow up and growing up refers to the frustration of a maternal desire. Thus, to grow up also means to communicate according to pre-established rules. In this way, children show some resistance to speaking in accordance with linguistic conventions, thus producing a symptom. To speak correctly is to impose a lack to the mother and to reject her expectations, leaving a subjection position.

The research pointed that out of the 5 children that used the story, 1 showed that the part of the tale that he/she liked the most was when the dwarves appeared. Set free from death, Snow White finds herself alone and abandoned in the forest with nowhere to go, until by chance she comes to the house of the dwarves, who provide her with a home, where she busies herself with chores, but none of them lust after her. The dwarves are creatures interested in wealth and do not want princesses. They are creatures that desire other things, not sex. This absence of interest for her makes their resistance comparable to the prepubertal child. In this way, the child does not need to comply with the position of an adult, does not need to impose his or her desires, remaining sheltered by his or her mother's care and desires. To remain in this position is to satisfy the mother's desire; it is to keep on being her baby without having to inhabit the territory of sexual exercise and, therefore, to remain infantilized, without needing to speak correctly.

Category 5 – Sleeping Beauty

The project of having a child happens when the couple lacks something. Thus, the narcissistic bet on this project evidences the rebirth of the search for completeness and for the reconstitution of the parents' childish questions. Sleeping Beauty had the privilege of meeting the parental desire as for number and gender. The princess was a daughter greatly desired by her parents and her arrival in the world was celebrated during a luxurious baptism, in which fairies granted her all charms a woman could have (Corso & Corso, 2006).

It is known that the idealized child is actually never born, and the real child is left with the battle of trying to be similar to the one he or she assumes this ideal might be. For the child to constitute himself or herself as a differentiated subject, the narcissistic bet needs to fail minimally so that the child's characteristics may appear (Ferrari & Piccinini, 2010). This occurs mostly because the child does not accept everything that is reserved to him or her, displaying points of resistance to that which has been intended to him or her.

The research data suggests that children with this speech pathology have trouble disconnecting from the maternal desire and, therefore, fear disappointing their mothers narcissistically and, for this reason, satisfy it, since they realize that the wrong way of speaking is overvalued, especially by the maternal role. This causes children to remain refractory in relation to the conventional ways of speaking in the society where they live.

A proof of that is the following data: out of the 4 children that used this narrative, most of them (3) pointed the moment when the baby is born as the part of the story that they liked the most, that is, they metaphorize, through the figure of the baby, their desire to remain in this position of completeness with their mothers. In addition, they were scared of the evil witch's curse: *"When the princess turns 15, she will prick her finger on the spindle and die"*.

Perhaps the reason for the displeasure with this fragment is in the hidden sense, given that the curse symbolizes the passage from being a baby before the family towards the exercise of sexuality, and the evil fairy, with her envious and harmful humor, exemplifies the mother's obscure side, where the child's place is at stake as a maternal possession, revealing the terrifying version of the love idyll where the delivery has its prices and that for this reason *"... um dia a bruxa veio pegá o bebê pá colocá ele na panela"* [one day the witch came, got the baby and put her inside the pot].

It is understood that the subjects of the research managed to not fulfill the parental desires completely, otherwise they would all be on the structuring field of psychosis. By satisfying narcissistically their mothers through the way they speak, however, children produce a speech symptom, assuming a childish position, that is, they produce a symptom for their parents since they operate as a supplementary circle that repairs a mistake of one of the parents, or even of both.

The twist in the story happens through a transgression: Sleeping Beauty pricks her finger on a spindle because she should not touch it. This is about an order that was not obeyed, however much the prohibition had aimed to protect her. She does what she should not do and the previous curse uttered by the evil fairy is the origin of the interdiction. In this way, the curse prescribes something that the future will not be able to avoid: growing up, loving and leaving (Corso & Corso, 2006). Thus, the child

that referred to the death of the princess as the moment he/she liked the most knew unconsciously that after death there is a rebirth towards a destination: growing up.

Category 6 – Aladdin and the Wonderful Lamp

The tale “Aladdin and the Wonderful Lamp” was used by one child who refused to point the part of the story that he/she liked the most and the least. Two hypotheses can be posed as to the child’s refusal. The first one is that the story may have touched some painful issue or a conflict that caused him/her to not show his/her desire to speak, as it could cause him/her great suffering; thinking from this perspective, something with which the child did not want to deal at that moment for subjective issues. The second hypothesis is that the tale might have not been able to access any question for this child at that moment. Because the child resisted to speaking about this story, it is not possible to draw any conclusions, due to the risk of bringing invalid data to the research.

Category 7 – Pinocchio

Although “Pinocchio” story was used by only one child, it raises some questions that can be considered in relation to the refractory position. The child that used the tale, when questioned about the part of the story he/she liked the most, answered that it was when the whale swallowed up Pinocchio and Geppetto.

After getting lost from Geppetto and making all possible mistakes, the boy comes back to his father and goes meet him inside a whale’s stomach. Pinocchio and Geppetto need to leave this huge body, and escaping from there means a second birth (Corso & Corso, 2006). It is possible to observe in the story that when they manage to leave the whale’s stomach both are no longer the same. Geppetto is old and Pinocchio finally wise. Thanks to Pinocchio’s courage, both leave together the gigantic belly that was locking them up. After that, the son works hard to provide for his weak and ill father, and then the puppet turns into a human and begins to study hard and to take care of his father.

The rebirth metaphor is widely used to symbolize a new beginning. For one to be born again, he or she needs to have died, and restarting means that something has come to an end. In this case, Pinocchio’s childhood had ended and along with it the illusion that life could go on without effort and responsibilities. Growing up means for children that they have to busy themselves with tasks and challenges that nobody could perform or overcome for them (Corso & Corso, 2006). And perhaps this is one of the main reasons why Pinocchio’s story was not among the favorite ones of the research subjects. It is certain that in times of alienation the child exists in the Other, meaning that it is a specular time necessary for a transformation to take place; however, the times of separation that enable the emergence of the subject are necessary. (Dias, 2012)

Separations are necessary so that children leave their place as their mothers’ object of desire, so that they cease to be children, so that they can grow up. It is necessary that the father interferes with the relationship of the mother with her child, interrupting it, somehow interdicting it in order to take the place as object of desire of this mother and to put her in this place as well in relation to his own desire. The father does so as a man but also as a representative of the cultural law, making the child his son or daughter, giving him or her this place. This is structuring for the child (Brauer, 1998). For this reason, leaving the entrails of a whale may be a hard signification for children, given that they once used to inhabit their mothers’ entrails. To be expelled helplessly from this belly, at the mercy of dangers and threats, is not an easy task for whom, until then, was totally protected by the mother.

Behaviors observed when the children’s speech was not understood

During the telling of stories it was possible to observe some reactions that the children displayed when questioned about a word that the researcher had not comprehended. In this way, the following points could be observed: perception of the error; errors during the spontaneous speech (tale); willingness/attempt to correct; change of topic; aggressiveness; communication with indicative gestures; inhibition (absence of speech or very low intonation); ignoring the researcher’s look and/or

corrective action. All these points allowed identifying the refractory position in the subjects involved in the research, as they refer to the child's lack of interest in being comprehended in his or her interactions and because the position presented in one tale was the same in all of the other tales chosen by the participants. This enabled the analysis below.

Regarding perception of errors, 8 out of the 10 children did not perceive the error, although all of them had errors in the spontaneous speech. The investigation on the perception of the error by the child was carried out through questions made by the researcher when the child expressed himself or herself verbally in an incorrect manner. When this happened, he or she was encouraged to repeat the word correctly. Although it is known that for phonological issues the child will hardly repeat a wrong word in a correct way, the researcher made a few attempts intending to see if the children at least showed some interest and/or availability to change/correct the word. In face of this, although none of them presented aggressive acts or words it was possible to observe that only 4 of them showed availability for correction attempts. The 6 children that were not willing to make the changes adopted the following attitudes: change of topic and attempts to ignore the researcher's look and corrective action.

It was also possible to verify that half of the children made attempts to communicate through indicative gestures, and 8 out of the 10 children seemed inhibited when questioned about a word or phrase not comprehended by the researcher. The analysis of the points allows concluding that all children adopted a refractory position in relation to the way of speaking in accordance with the linguistic conventions of their social group. This is highlighted because even those children that perceived their errors in some moments, when questioned about it during the spontaneous speech and during the tale none of them perceived them.

The analysis by the judges

As for the analysis by the judges, both the Speech Therapy professional and the Psychology professional that made use of the clinical-theoretical framework of Psychoanalysis managed to identify the refractory position in all of the children participating in the study. Behaviors like inhibition, attempts to ignore the researcher's look and/or corrective action, frequent gesticulation, absence of questioning about his or her difficulty of production/speech, need the researcher felt to insist on enabling and/or triggering his or her creation, verbalization and exploration of the material, were identified by these judges. The researcher did not mention these points to the judges. In this way, it is noticeable that they were identified due to the look that these professionals have about the subjects, understanding that their symptom is something that goes beyond the error and, therefore, is a subjective formation.

The perspective of the other two judges, one from the Speech Therapy area and the other one from the Psychology area, but with other theoretical approaches, promoted an opinion different from that of the other two earlier mentioned. Here is what happened in these cases: the judge from the Psychology area did not identify the refractory position in any of the children, justifying that all of them turned their attention to the researcher. As for the judge from the Speech Therapy area, he identified the refractory position in the children. His justification for having verified this data was that these children did not respond to the researcher's corrective action and, therefore, ignored the attempt of speech correction. About the children that, according to this judge, did not assume a refractory position, he justified by saying that they responded to the researcher's request of trying to correct their speech but without success.

Before the judges' opinions it is possible to perceive two modes of thinking of speech pathologies and of the way to lead clinical assistance. One of them refers to error as a symptomatic manifestation that hides enigmas and carries a singularity. This form of comprehending the child, therefore, puts him or her in the place of a subject that claims for a change in speech and in the condition of speaker addressed to the therapist. This view differs from the second one, in which the speech is reduced to the periphery of the body, reduced to the emission-reception pair, and the speaker to the mouth-ear pair. Thus, the affectations that the symptom produces are lost and the effects of the subject who is not considered in his or her symptom are nullified, which leads to the view of error in speech production.

The fact is that, in this way, the clinic of the specificities of those who work with children and speech pathologies does not face the mystery of the reason why a subject produces a problematic

speech, given that the attempt of positive apprehension of what occurs in this speech is persistently covered by a manual and the assumption that speech can be taught, causing the reduction of the subject/patient to the organism (Faria & Trigo, 2004).

Final Considerations

The data suggests that all 10 children were assuming a refractory position, because they stand indifferent before the pathology. It can be concluded, for now, that the phonological disorder is not causing unease to them yet, and for this reason the subjects do not implicate themselves in moving their symptom. It is worth highlighting that though refractory in relation to linguistic rules all children presented moments when they produced defenses from the maternal desire, which causes them to feel neurotically structured, otherwise we would have subjects psychically organized on a psychotic structure.

What was presented in the subjects of this research was not the fact that the third place, the paternal role did not exist. The mothers somehow indicated this to their children. What happened is that the fathers probably found difficulties when performing their role, opening a space larger than necessary to mothers in the relationship with the children. As a result, the children produced a symptomatic speech in an attempt to meet somehow the parental narcissistic expectations, an ideal impossible to be achieved since one needs to grow up.

Children are for their parents the supplementary circle that repairs a mistake by one or both of them. Thus, it could be noticed that the children organized a speech system in an attempt to make up for the paternal failure and to meet the maternal desire. In addition, however, one can think that the subjects elaborated a symptom as an attempt of healing, because it reveals that the child is still in a position of desubjectivation in relation to the maternal desire. In face of this, it is understood that the symptom is an appeal to the father when he begins to show her exhaustion (Lacan, 1956/1995). In this case, it seems that abandoning the symptom, which refers to a singular production of the child, and speaking according to the linguistic convention may generate distress because it would mean to meet the Other's demand, to meet the maternal demand and to remain tied to it.

It is due to this conditions that therapists that dedicate themselves to the childhood field need to listen attentively to the questions that lead a child to manifest such symptom, and to understand it as a speech to be decoded, because what might be involved in this symptom is the construction of something poorly founded and a response to a parental demand.

Symptomatic speeches are singular and enigmatic events that lose their importance when the therapist place them only on the land of the error. Taken this way, speech pathologies end up reflecting an erasure of the subject and of the suffering dimension. There is an evident lack of knowledge about the reason why a speech occurs like that, symptomatically disarranged, and it is not possible to provide the child another way to do it.

References

- Bender, S. & Surreaux L. M. (2011). Os efeitos da fala da criança: a escuta do sintoma na clínica de linguagem. *Cadernos IL*, 42(1), 129-145.
- Benine, R. (2001). "Ómideio" – o que é isso?: questões e reflexões sobre dislalias, distúrbios articulatórios funcionais e desvios fonológicos. Tese de Doutorado Não-Publicada Programa de Pós-Graduação em Linguística Aplicada e Estudos da Linguagem, Pontifícia Universidade Católica de São Paulo, São Paulo.
- Bernardino, L. M. F. (2008). Aspectos psíquicos do desenvolvimento infantil. In D. B. Wanderley. (Org.). *O cravo e a rosa: a psicanálise e a pediatria: um diálogo possível?* (pp. 54-66). Salvador: Ágalma.
- Bettelheim, B. (1980). *A psicanálise dos contos de fadas*. (19a. ed.). Rio de Janeiro: Paz e Terra.
- Brauer, J. F. (1998). O sujeito e a deficiência. *Estilos da Clínica*, 3(5), 56-62.
- Corso, D. L. & Corso, M. (2006). *Fadas no divã: psicanálise nas histórias infantis*. Porto Alegre: Artmed.
- Dias, I. S. (2012). A mãe suficientemente faltosa. *Correio da APPOA: percurso de escola (I)*, 1(214), 37-46.

- Dolto, F. (1992). *A imagem inconsciente do corpo*. São Paulo: Perspectiva.
- Faria, V. O. & Trigo, M. F. (2004). Contribuições da psicanálise na abordagem das falas sintomáticas de crianças. *Colóquio do LEPSI IP/FE-USP*, 5. Recuperado em 13 de junho, de 2014, de http://www.proceedings.scielo.br/scielo.php?script=sci_arttext&pid=MSC000000032004000100060&lng=en&nrm=abn
- Ferrari, A. (2012). Sintoma da criança, atualização do processo constitutivo parental? *Tempo Psicanalítico*, 44(2), 229-319.
- Ferrari, A. & Piccinini, C. (2010). Função materna e mito familiar: evidências a partir de um estudo de caso. *Ágora*, 13(2), 243-257.
- Gurski, R. (2010). Algumas observações sobre a clínica da infância. *Revista da Associação Psicanalítica de Porto Alegre*, 39(1), 90-102.
- Grunwell, P. (1990). Os desvios fonológicos numa perspectiva linguística. In M. Yavas. *Desvios fonológicos em crianças: teoria, pesquisa e tratamento* (pp. 53-77). Porto Alegre: Mercado Aberto.
- Jerusalinsky, A. (2011). *Para compreender a criança: chaves psicanalíticas*. São Paulo: Instituto Langage.
- Kamers, M. & Baratto, G. (2004). O discurso parental e sua relação com a inscrição da criança no universo simbólico dos pais. *Psicologia: Ciência e Profissão*, 24(3), 40-47.
- Laznik, M. C. (2013). *A hora e a vez do bebê*. São Paulo: Instituto Langage.
- Lacan, J. (1995). *O Seminário, livro 4: a relação de objeto*. Rio de Janeiro: Jorge Zahar. (Original publicado em 1956).
- Minayo, M. C. S. (2010). *O desafio do conhecimento: pesquisa qualitativa em saúde*. (12a. ed.). São Paulo: Hucitec.
- Pagliarin, K. C.; Keske-Soares, M. & Mota, H. (2009). Terapia fonológica em irmãos com diferentes graus de gravidade do desvio fonológico. *Revista CEFAC*, 11(1), 20-24.
- Pereira, A. S. & Keske-Soares, M. (2008). Significação parental acerca do desvio fonológico. *Psicologia em Estudo*, 14(14), 787-795.
- Santana, A. P.; Machado, M. L. C. de A.; Bianchi, K. S. da R.; Freitas, M. de S. & Marques, J. M. (2010). O articulatório e o fonológico na clínica da linguagem: da teoria à prática. *CEFAC*, 12(2), 193-201.
- Saraiva, L. M., Reinhardt, M. C & Souza, R. C. (2012). A função paterna e seu papel na dinâmica familiar e no desenvolvimento mental infantil. *Revista Brasileira de Psicoterapia*, 14(3), 52-67.
- Wertzner, A. F. (2004). Fonologia: desenvolvimento e alterações. In L. P. Ferreira, D. M. Befi-Lopes, & S. C. Limongi. O. *Tratado de fonoaudiologia* (pp. 772-786). São Paulo: Roca.
- Winnicott, D. W. (2007). *O ambiente e os processos de maturação*. Porto Alegre: Artmed. (Original publicado em 1983).

Received: Sept. 17, 2014

Approved: July 17, 2015

Taís Cervi: Psychology graduate from the Universidade Regional do Noroeste do Estado do Rio Grande do Sul; Clinical Infant Assistance specialist from the Centro Universitário Franciscano; developmental disorders specialist from the Centro Lúcia Coriat; master in Human Communication Disorders from the Universidade Federal de Santa Maria, Brasil.

Marcia Keske-Soares: speech therapist; professor of the Speech Therapy course and of the Graduate Program in Human Communication Disorders at the Universidade Federal de Santa Maria, PhD in Applied Linguistics from the Pontifícia Universidade Católica do Rio Grande do Sul.

Angela Maria Schneider Drügg: PhD in Education from the Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul, Brasil; professor at the Universidade Regional do Noroeste do Estado do Rio Grande do Sul, Brasil.