

DIALOGUES BETWEEN C. G. JUNG AND WILLIAM JAMES: THE PSYCHICAL RESEARCHES

Pedro Henrique Costa de Resende¹, Orcid: <http://orcid.org/0000-0001-6313-7870>

Walter Melo², Orcid: <http://orcid.org/0000-0002-5755-0666>

ABSTRACT. C.G. Jung and William James shared several research interests. At the conference held at Clark University in 1909, the two authors could meet and talk. The debates were especially on topics regarding psychical research, contemporarily also called anomalistic or psi-related experiences, which were not considered on the conference schedule. Since his period as a medical student, Jung has been interested in anomalous phenomena of consciousness, having researched the prominent authors associated with the spiritualism of the 18th and 19th centuries. William James was a recognized researcher of the so-called psychic phenomena, participating in societies such as Society for Psychical Research and the American Society for Psychical Research. Through their studies, James and Jung aspired to contribute to dynamic psychology, also called depth psychology. This article aimed to broaden the dialogues established at Clark University, rescuing important information about the theory of the two authors.

Keywords: C.G. Jung; William James; psychical research.

DIÁLOGOS ENTRE C. G. JUNG E WILLIAM JAMES: AS PESQUISAS PSÍQUICAS

RESUMO. C. G. Jung e William James compartilhavam uma série de interesses de pesquisa. Por ocasião da Conferência realizada na Universidade de Clark, no ano de 1909, os dois autores tiveram a oportunidade de se encontrar e conversar. Os debates abordaram temas que não estavam na pauta da conferência, especialmente pesquisas psíquicas, também chamadas modernamente de experiências anomalísticas ou relacionadas à 'psi'. Desde seu período como estudante de medicina, Jung se interessou pelos fenômenos anômalos da consciência, tendo pesquisado os principais autores associados ao espiritualismo dos séculos XVIII e XIX. William James foi pesquisador reconhecido dos chamados fenômenos psíquicos, tendo participado de sociedades como a Society for Psychical Research e a American Society for Psychical Research. Através de seus estudos, James e Jung buscavam contribuir para a psicologia dinâmica, também chamada de psicologia profunda. O objetivo deste artigo foi ampliar os diálogos estabelecidos na universidade de Clark, resgatando informações importantes acerca da teoria dos dois autores.

Palavras-chave: C. G. Jung; William James; pesquisas psíquicas.

¹ Universidade Federal de Juiz de Fora (UFJF), Juiz de Fora-MG, Brazil. E-mail: heloim@mgconecta.com.br

² Universidade Federal de Juiz de Fora (UFJF), Juiz de Fora-MG, Brazil. Universidade Federal de São João del Rei, São João del Rei-MG, Brazil. E-mail: wmelojr@gmail.com



DIÁLOGOS ENTRE C. G. JUNG Y WILLIAM JAMES: LAS INVESTIGACIONES PSÍQUICAS

RESUMEN. C. G. Jung y William James compartían una serie de intereses de investigación. En la conferencia celebrada en la Universidad de Clark, en 1909, los dos autores tuvieron la oportunidad de encontrarse y conversar. Los debates se centraron en temas que no estaban en la agenda de la conferencia, especialmente en la investigación psíquica, también llamada en la actualidad experiencia anomalística o relacionada con la psi. Jung de su tiempo como estudiante de medicina se interesó por fenómenos anómalos de conciencia, después de habiendo investigado los autores principales asociados con el espiritismo de los siglos XVIII y XIX. William James era conocido investigador de los llamados fenómenos psíquicos, y participó en las sociedades como la Society for Psychical Research y la American Society for Psychical Research. James y Jung a través de sus estudios trataron de contribuir a la psicología dinámica, también llamada psicología profunda. El propósito de este artículo es ampliar el diálogo establecido en la Universidad de Clark, rescatando la información importante acerca de la teoría de los dos autores.

Palabras clave: C. G. Jung; William James; investigaciones psíquicas.

Introduction

In 1909, Clark University, in the United States, hosted a conference that was attended by important names in science, researchers such as Franz Boas (1858-1942), Ernest Rutheford (1871-1937) and Albert Abraham Michelson (1852-1931). Psychology was represented by William James (1842-1910), Sigmund Freud (1856-1939) and Carl Gustav Jung (1875-1961). It was the first time that a psychoanalytic delegation had come to America. Besides Freud and Jung, Sándor Ferenczi (1873-1933), Ernest Jones (1879-1958) and Abraham Arden Brill (1874-1948) participated in the event. The conference, held in Worcester, Massachusetts, was organized by Granville Stanley Hall (1844-1924), president of the institution, to develop the debate between the main areas of study at the university. At the time, William James was already considered one of the most influential American philosophers and psychologists. At Hall's invitation, he attended one of Freud's lectures and also spent time with Jung. The American thinker believed that the ideas defended by psychoanalysis could bring necessary clarifications about human nature. However, Freud's criticisms of religion³ bothered him (Barzun, 1983; James, 1920).

Concerning Jung, James was quite impressed, as the two authors agreed on the importance of the religious phenomenon for the human psyche. They talked for a while at Hall's house about parapsychology, faith healing, spiritualism, and religion's psychology themes. Jung was particularly interested in James' research on so-called parapsychic phenomena, especially the author's studies about the medium Leonora Piper (1857-1950). These subjects occupied James' research for some time. They were developed in his lectures at the Lowell Institute in 1896 (Taylor, 1983) and in his *Gifford lectures de 1901-*

³ Freud had been interviewed by Albert Albrecht for the *Boston Evening Transcript* on September 11, 1909. He criticized the forms of religious therapy practiced in the United States as unscientific and dangerous. James (1920), in a letter to Flournoy, disagrees with this position. According to Bair (2003), the American philosopher supported pastoral counseling and faith healing, especially the practices developed by the Boston 'Emanuel' Movement, as forms of non-medical psychotherapy.

1902/ *The varieties of religious experience* (James, 2010). Jung's impressions were similarly positive: in his *Letters*, he states that James was one of the most impressive figures he had ever met in his life, he admired his vision openness and how, in his research, he allowed phenomena to present themselves spontaneously, without forcing an interpretation in a specific direction. Jung also stated that he could only talk uncomplicatedly with two theorists: Flournoy and James (Jung, 2003).

For Bair (2003), the event in Clark marks the beginning of a process that will lead Jung to move away from the psychoanalytic movement and search for new theoretical sources, including James' theory. For some time after his break with Freud, the pragmatic theory and the study of the American philosopher's religion will be Jung's guides (Innamorati, 2013; Shamdasani, 2012).

Therefore, our focus in this work will be to broaden the theme of the dialogues initiated at Clark University, from the common interests of James and Jung, religious and spiritualism experiences, phenomena generically designated by the name of psychic, parapsychic or anomalous.

At the Clark University Conference in 1909, Jung stayed at G. Stanley Hall's home. It was in this context that the Swiss psychiatrist made his first contact with William James. The meeting with the distinguished American philosopher occurred after dinner. Hall had asked James to present some of the results of his research on extrasensory perception with Mrs. Piper. James then hands the president of Clark a set of papers on the topic, to which Jung is exceptionally interested. After that event, Jung would still have talked to James the following night. "They met twice, and the subject was the same on both occasions: parapsychology, spiritualism, faith healing and other non-medicinal applications of psychology" (Bair, 2003, p. 222). Jung expresses himself about these conversations in the following terms:

Apart from the personal impression he made on me, I am indebted to him chiefly for his books. We talked mostly about his experiments with Mrs. Piper, which are well enough known, and did not speak of his philosophy at all. I was particularly interested to see what his attitude was to so-called 'occult phenomena'. I admired his European culture and the openness of his nature. He was a distinguished personality and conversation with him was extremely pleasant. He was quite naturally without affectation and pomposity and answered my questions and interjections as though speaking to an equal. Unfortunately, he was already ailing at the time so I could not press him too hard. Aside from Theodore Flournoy he was the only outstanding mind with whom I could conduct an uncomplicated conversation. I therefore honour his memory and have always remembered the example he set me (Jung, 2003, p. 164, author's emphasis).

As can be seen from Jung's statements, both the spiritualist theme researched and James's work caught his attention and became important for him. The Swiss psychiatrist had already shown interest in the subject of the debates in question long before the meeting mentioned above. Bair (2003, p. 69) states that Jung's choice of psychiatry was motivated by the possibility of pursuing "[...] with his main interests: spiritualism and religious theory". At Jung's time, psychiatry was still establishing itself as a branch of medicine. Many physicians began their studies on the mind by analyzing anomalous phenomena of consciousness, such as trance, dual personality and somnambulism, a field where science and religion were still somehow blended.

C.G. Jung's interest in psychic research

Since the time of his medical school in Basel, Jung was interested in the so-called occult phenomena. At that time, he participated in a society for students called Zofingia, in which his father, Paul Jung, had also participated. Jung frequently gave lectures in this society, whose themes were his studies on parapsychic phenomena. Jung (1975a) himself states that he was constantly trying to convince his friends and colleagues about the veracity of the spiritualist proposals. In 1900, he chose to work at the Burghölzli Hospital, a reference point for psychiatric treatment. At Bleuler's incentive, the hospital's director, his work at the end of his medical course was about his cousin Helene Preiswerk, who, on mediunic séances organized by the family, claimed to get in touch with deceased relatives. Posteriorly, this study was published by Jung as part of his *Collected works* - first volume, with the title *On the psychology and pathology of so-called occult phenomena*.

For Bair (2003), regardless of the explanation given to parapsychic phenomena, these events were already experienced within Jung's family. The author refers to two curious events. In the first of them, young Jung was in his room on a summer afternoon, when he heard a shot in the kitchen like the sound of a pistol; he went into the dining room and found the seventy-year-old walnut table, broken from the center to the edge, in a way that had nothing related to the natural grain of the wood. The hot and humid weather was not conducive to the accident, which would be more likely in a dry winter climate. In a second event, Jung arrives at his house and finds his mother, sister and maid very apprehensive; another noise has happened, this time in a side cabinet in the kitchen; he looked into it and found a knife made of very resistant metal, broken into several pieces. Jung takes the knife to a cutler, who claims that the object would not have naturally broken like that, only through an intentional act. The knife in question has been kept since the incident. Parapsychic phenomena would be interesting for the psychologist under several aspects:

They provide information about things the layman knows nothing of, such as the exteriorization of unconscious processes, about their content, and about the possible sources of parapsychological phenomena. They are of particular importance in investigating the localization of the unconscious and the phenomenon of synchronicity, which points to a relativization of space and time and also of matter (Jung, 2012a, p. 338).

Jung's interest in the theme was not limited to the experiences and descriptions of them. Spiritualism will resonate in a more significant number of elements in the works of the Swiss author. Especially the case of the young medium Helene, who is analyzed *On the psychology and pathology of so-called occult phenomena* work (Jung, 2011).

Firstly, Jung assessed the case from a clinical and pathologizing perspective. The alleged manifesting spirits would be contents of Helene's psyche, dissociated from her primary personality, which Jung would define as complex, "[...] a notion based on a refutation of monolithic ideas of personality" (Samuels, 1986, p. 22). In its late definition, a complex would be a "[...] gathering of images and ideas, conglomerated around a nucleus derived from one or more archetypes, and characterized by a common emotional tonality" (Samuels, 1986, p. 22). This same interpretive perspective on the manifestations of spirits will be presented in 1919 in a lecture given by Jung at the Society for Psychical Research (SPR) in London. In this presentation, Jung states:

Before thoroughly analyzing the psychological foundations of belief in souls, I would like to recall the above facts briefly. I have particularly highlighted three sources that constitute the true basis of belief in spirits: the appearance of spirits, dreams, and pathological disturbances (Jung, 1975b, p. 579).

Jung points out that the common point between these three sources is that the psyche is not an indivisible whole but capable of fragmenting. These fragments could relate to the 'everyday self', but some had the independence to the point of presenting themselves as autonomous personalities. Jung highlights: "These parts of the soul I called autonomous complexes and founded my theory of the psyche complexes on their existence" (Jung, 1975b, p. 582).

As much as these experiences about mediumship helped the Swiss author construct a psychological interpretation, Jung was not satisfied with this explanation for the definition of the totality of parapsychological phenomena. In a note after his presentation at the SPR, he states:

After collecting psychological experiences from many people and in many countries for fifty years, I no longer feel as secure as in 1919 when I wrote that statement. To be blunt, I doubt that an exclusively psychological approach can do justice to the phenomena in question. Not just the findings of parapsychology, but my own theoretical reflections, outlined in *On the Nature of the Psyche*, have led to certain postulates that approach the domain of conceptions of nuclear physics, that is, the space-time continuum. This opens up the whole question of the transpsychic reality immediately underlying the psyche (Jung, 1975c, p. 600, nota 15, author's emphasis).

Later, Jung would also name these synchronicity events, in which a personal experience could overcome the laws of space, time and causality (Jung, 2013a). Synchronicity is formulated by Jung based on two factors: 1) Initially "[...] an unconscious image reaches consciousness directly (literally) or indirectly (symbolized or suggested), in the form of a dream, association or 'premonition'; 2) an objective situation coincides with this content" (Jung, 1975d, para. 858, emphasis added). Therefore, synchronicity would be the connection between a subjective factor and an objective external event.

Jung's set of personal experiences, his patients' experiences and his studies on the anomalous field were integrated. Two essays were initially produced on the theme: *On Synchronicity*, a lecture presented at the Eranos Conferences in 1951 and *The Interpretation of nature and the psyche* from 1952, written in partnership with the physicist Wolfgang Pauli (Main, 1997). These two works were integrated into the 1952 expanded publication *Synchronicity, an acausal connecting principle*.

For Charet (1993), Jung's background with the spiritualist theme is very old, rooted as a common belief among some of his closest relatives, and exhaustively researched by the Swiss author since his youth. About these theoretical researches, we will describe below some works that, in our opinion, contributed to the Swiss author's understanding of the parapsychic theme.

One of the first books that Jung would have consulted was the one written by Immanuel Kant (1724-1804), *Dreams of a spirit-seer* (Kant, 1900), in which the philosopher describes the experiences of the Swedish visionary Emanuel Swedenborg (1688-1772). In this work, Kant makes a critical reading of Swedenborg's views and analyzes the belief of many individuals in the existence of spirits. In general, Kant's vision in the book is rationalist, defining many of the experiences as fanciful. Still, in a letter to Fraülein Charlotte von Knobloch, he states that he had been interested for some time and sought to know more about Swedenborg (Jung, 2012a). For Charet (1993, p. 101, author's emphasis), "[...] this indicates that eight years before the letter to von Knobloch, Kant was speculating about things in themselves, which he would later call 'noumena' in his *Critique of pure reason*".

From then on, Jung began to read several authors associated with spiritualism in the 18th and 19th centuries, such as Friedrich Zöllner (1834 – 1882), professor of physics and

astronomy at the University of Leipzig. Among Zöllner's main works, *Transcendental physics* (1880) stands out, in which he coordinates a team of researchers in the investigation of phenomena presented by the North American medium Henry Slade (1835-1905). According to Treitel (2004), in Zöllner's team were Wilhelm Weber (1804-1891), Gustav Fechner (1801-1887) and Wilhelm Wundt (1832-1920). The latter had several debates with the team, not accepting Zöllner's spiritualist proposals (Sommer, 2013).

Henry Slade had been judged in London's Bow Street court on charges of fraud. The complaint came from Professor Edwin Ray Lankester (1847-1929), who had also researched the phenomena presented by Slade. Initially, the medium was convicted, and the sentence was appealed. Finally, the process was annulled for an insane mistake. Slade claimed to communicate with spirits, managing to materialize sentences on a slate spontaneously⁴. Zöllner describes several experiences of this kind and attests to Slade's sincerity, despite all the accusations mentioned above against him. (Zöllner, 1901).

Jung's readings on William Crookes (1832-1919), a British chemist who researched mediums such as the Scottish Daniel Dunglas Home (1833-1886) and the young Englishwoman Florence Cook (1856-1904) are also from this period. Crookes' first experiments on the subject, in the years 1870 to 1873, were published in the *Quarterly Journal of Science* in January 1874 and caused great controversy in the scientific community, as the British researcher, member of the *Royal Society of London*, claimed to have witnessed the appearance of luminous phenomena and human figures, manifestations of sounds and noises, and the spontaneous movement of objects, all of this, in a strictly controlled environment (Crookes, 1927).

Crookes was not, initially, a supporter of Spiritist ideas. In his book *Researches in the phenomena of the spiritualism* (1874), he claims that he would apply to his research object the same rigor that he had apprehended in years of scientific labor and that the spiritualists' explanations lacked consistency, as can be seen in the following passage:

The spiritualist pseudo-scientist professes to know everything: no calculation problems afflict his serenity, no complex experiments, no long and laborious readings; no attempt to make clear in words what gladdens the heart and uplifts the mind. He speaks fluently of all the sciences and arts, overloading the inquirer with terms like 'electro-biology', 'psychology', 'animal magnetism', etc. - A mere play on words, showing ignorance rather than understanding. Popular science such as this can hardly guide discovery by rushing into an unknown future. Trustworthy science workers must be conscientious not to allow the reins to fall into wrong and incompetent hands (Crookes, 1927, p. 5, author's emphasis).

The book in question describes the various experiments applied by Crookes to mediums and the schemes and precautions set up to avoid fraud. In many of the experiments, other researchers and assistants were present. Throughout the description, Crookes acquires a tone of conviction about the phenomena he witnessed. About Florence, the young woman researched, he affirms her total honesty: "[...] the perfect truth and honesty of Miss Cook" (Crookes, 1927, p. 104). Throughout each series of experiments, the scientist made public his opinion, generally favoring the spiritualist cause. Personalities in the scientific community and the general public were divided in opinion, one in support and others rejecting Crookes' conclusions.

⁴ In the entry 'writing instruments' in the Ceale Glossary, we find the information that the slate was a standard teaching tool in the 19th century, a kind of blackboard that required the use of stone chalk or slate pencil for writing ([HTTP: //ceale.fae.ufmg.br/app/webroot/glossarioceale](http://ceale.fae.ufmg.br/app/webroot/glossarioceale)).

Jung (1975a, p. 96) states that: “[...] the observations of the spiritualists, weird and questionable as they seemed to me, were the first accounts I had seen of objective psychic phenomena”. Zöllner and Crookes were constant readings of Jung. The Swiss author read practically every book referring to these researchers, insisting that they were “[...] martyrs of science, and incorporated the discoveries of these authors into his arguments” (Bair, 2003, p. 70). However, he was amazed at the denial of his colleagues, who eagerly refused any explanation other than what was already established. He questioned himself why it was defined as impossible. He preferred the term possibility, which for him represented something exciting and attractive. The human condition gained in depth and complexity through these studies, which explored the human mind's specific capacities and opened the perspective and possibility of a continuity of consciousness beyond earthly life.

Another of the authors related to the theme that Jung references in his work is Justinus Kerner (1786-1862), a German physician and poet belonging to the Romantic school. Kerner is best known for his book *The seeress of Prevorst* (1829). He describes his contact with his patient Friederike Hauffe (1801-1829), her somnambulist states, her prophetic visions and the cures that Hauffe would have carried out. Jung did not consider Kerner a scientist per se; many of his interpretations of the phenomena presented by the so-called Prevorst seer are considered naive. Hauffe was born in 1801 in the village of Prevorst, near the city of Löwenstein, in the state of Baden-Württemberg, Germany. The girl had a normal childhood, and the only strangeness was her dreams, which the child described to relatives and friends very vividly and which, usually, came true. Also, from childhood, Hauffe claimed to see spirits that, according to her statements, awakened in her the most diverse feelings and sensations. Some of the visions left her distressed and extremely anguished, while she found peace and comfort in others.

After her marriage, Hauffe exhibits a series of physical changes. The death of a religious person with whom she was in love causes a seven-year depression. From then onwards, she presents states of frequent somnambulism, every day at 5 pm, the time corresponding to the religious' funeral. At the time, she was consulted by several doctors who could not determine a cure for her convulsive attacks and fevers, which were also constant. During this period, she was referred for treatment at the physician Justinus Kerner's home in the city of Weinsberg. Kerner then proceeds to investigate the strange phenomena presented by the young woman. However, his interest in occult phenomena predated his meeting with Prevorst's seer, as he had already written a book on the subject called *History of two somnambulists*. In sequence, *The Seeress of Prevorst* then later writes *History of Some Possessed of Our Time*, *The night domain of natural phenomenon* and *On Possession, evil-demonic magnetic*. The 1829 book was the first psychiatric work devoted to a single patient and became a best seller (Kerner, 2012; Shamdasani, 2012).

For Jung (1960), Kerner's stories did not prove anything about *post mortem* existence, but they revealed important aspects of psychological phenomenology in the relations established between the conscious and the unconscious. According to the Swiss author, in the case of Hauffe, specific thought processes were at an unconscious level in such a way that she did not recognize them as her own, externalizing them in visions of forms and apparitions. Kerner, however, had no doubts about his seer since he was already convinced of the facts presented by her. Regarding the work of Justinus Kerner, despite his conclusion's contrary to the spiritualist cause, Jung does not pathologize the phenomena described by him. In his seminars of 1933, entitled *Modern psychology*, he reserves some

lectures for the analysis of the work *The seeress of Prevorst*, leaving room for the possibility of the existence of supernormal perceptions.

According to Shamdasani (2012), reading the work mentioned above in 1897 significantly affected Jung's subsequent career. His interpretations on the topic were more favorable than what he expressed in his lectures. According to Zumstein-Preiswerk (1975), Jung presented his cousin Helene with a copy of the book *The seeress of Prevorst* when he started participating in the mediunic séances organized by his family. His writing about the sessions followed the same style as Kerner: later, these writings would be the conclusion work of the Swiss psychiatrist's medical course (Jung, 2011).

Another book whose central theme is evaluating the spiritualist phenomenon is *From India to the planet Mars: a study of a case of somnambulism with glossolalia* (1900). This work had a significant influence on Jung's analytical psychology. By 1900, the book quickly became a *best seller*. The author, Theodore Flournoy, physician and philosopher, had studied with Wilhelm Wundt. In 1891, Flournoy became a professor at the University of Geneva, where he founded an experimental psychology laboratory. From the end of 1894 until 1899, he followed the sessions organized around the medium Élise Catherine Müller (1861-1929). The phenomena presented by this woman aroused Flournoy's interest in a psychological evaluation of the case. Later this study became the cited work. In the book, the young woman is named by the pseudonym Héléne Smith. Her stories told in a trance state are described and grouped into three sets that the author called: the Hindu cycle, the Royal cycle, and the Martian cycle.

Through a detailed description, Héléne manifests in a state of trance the personalities of her stories. In the first of these, she is Princess Simandini in the reign of Prince Sivruka in India. In the second, she gives life to Marie Antoinette, queen of the French Revolution period. Finally, the third cycle concerns Héléne's revelations about life on Mars, even describing the language that would be spoken on the planet. Regarding the last one, Flournoy (2012, p. 2) states: "It is in this astronomical somnambulism that the phenomenon of glossolalia appears, which consists in the manufacture and use of an unknown language, and which is one of the main objects of this study".

The initial part of the book is dedicated to the analysis of Héléne Smith. She is described as a young woman, around 30 years old, in vigorous health, very different from the sickly and disturbed type who is erroneously associated with mediums, according to Flournoy (2012). At the time, Héléne occupied a position in the direction of a trading house. Then, he evaluates one of the personalities manifested by the medium, Leopold, described by her as her spiritual guide. In her trances, the young woman gave life to Leopold. He claimed to be Giuseppe Balsamo, Count Gagliostro, an Italian alchemist and adventurer, best known for Alexandre Dumas' work, *The Memoirs of a physician*. Later, the author moves on to the analysis of historical cycles.

For Flournoy (2012), Héléne's novels presented the exact language of dreams. That is, they were the result of her subliminal imagination. The histories would be in part cryptomnesia, that is, forgotten memories of the medium's readings stored in her subconscious. Héléne's manifestations, despite being extraordinarily elaborate and full of historical elements, would result from a powerful subconscious imagination. However, except for the martian cycle, which presents itself as the most fanciful, many of the events reported intrigued the Genevan philosopher⁵. However, these fantasies would have a double

⁵ About the events described in the Hindu cycle, Flournoy reports in his book the great difficulty in finding historical references. The philosopher wrote to professors studying Indian history: from the three initially consulted, none was able

function. On the one hand, compensatory, that is, a reaction to the difficulties of life; and, on the other, teleological, defined by Flournoy (2012) as the role that fantasies and dreams would play in the individual's future psychological development.

Jung is highly interested in the book of Flournoy, writes to the author, offering himself to translate the work into German. However, a translator had already been assigned. Since his reading of *From India to the planet Mars*, Jung has begun to adopt Flournoy's approach to interpreting anomalous phenomena of consciousness, including fantasy, dreams and trances. At the same time that he corresponded with Freud, the Swiss psychiatrist approached Flournoy, having visited the philosopher in Geneva. His book *Transformations and symbols of the libido* (1912), later rewritten with the title *Symbols of transformation* (2012d)⁶ was guided by Flournoy's conception of the creative imagination, in which the creative capacity of the unconscious is considered superior to that of consciousness. In *Memories, Dreams and Reflections*, there is a chapter dedicated to Theodore Flournoy, in which Jung states that the philosopher's support was fundamental to his theoretical break with psychoanalysis. Like William James, Flournoy helped Jung invest in continuing his studies on the psychology of religion and, in the field of philosophy, to examine pragmatism (Jung, 1975a).

Besides the aforementioned authors, Jung's list of mentions on the spiritualist theme could continue with Franz Xaver Von Baader, Jakob Böhme, Carl DuPrel, Adam Karl August von Eschenmayer, Joseph Ennemoser, Joseph von Görres, Johann Karl Passavant, Emanuel Swedenborg, among others, that the Swiss psychiatrist considered as precursors of modern psychology (Ellenberger, 1970; Crabtree, 1993; Jung, 2012b; Jung, 2012b; Kerner, 2012). These authors form a bridge between their interests and the research developed by William James.

William James and Psychic Research

As a philosopher and psychologist, James sought to assess the anomalous phenomena of consciousness, being a reference in the subject. He was an active participant in societies in America and Europe, such as the Society for Psychical Research and the American Society for Psychical Research, which aimed to study and evaluate exceptional states of mind through the scientific method. This meant knowing whether telepathy, *poltergeist*, hauntings and messages from spirits were facts or frauds.

These events focused on debates in the second half of the 19th century, reported in the press and referenced in the literature. Before the attention aroused by the phenomena, science could not stay away. It should investigate. According to Ellenberger (1970), a rich bibliography of the period was also produced by psychologists, besides William James, authors as Frederic Myers (1843-1901) and Pierre Janet (1859-1947) studied events such as automatic writing and trance, as forms of manifestation of the subconscious. Barzun (1983, p. 239) highlights James' assertion: "If the hypnotic trance had become genuine after long skepticism and denunciation, it was rational to assume that other impossible things in

to confirm the names and events reported by Hélène, only later she found a book authored by De Marlès, *General history of India, ancient and modern from the year 2000 BC to our own times*, which confirmed the names and facts mentioned. In Geneva, Flournoy found only two copies (Flournoy, 2012).

⁶ Frank Miller, the woman whose fantasies are evaluated in *Symbols of Transformation*, was initially a case studied by Flournoy (Jung, 2013a).

the scientism lexicon could be factually proven [...]”, again demonstrating James' indifference to the definition of what may or may not be researched.

James' experiments reflect much of the context in which he lived. Boston was emblematic, as its population included many phrenologists, herbalists, healers, followers of mesmerism and mediums, who offered advice and health treatments. The dispute with official medicine led to the attempt to implement a law project in Massachusetts to ban the unorthodox health practices of mediums and healers. James was in favor of all religious practices, and his argument was regarding the efficacy of hypnotism which, in Europe, came to be considered an unscientific technique (Murphy & Ballou, 1973; Sech, Araujo, & Moreira-Almeida, 2013).

Leading figures at Harvard came to organize a research group to assess the phenomena presented by these individuals. Benjamim Peirce (1809-1880), Louis Agassiz (1807-1873) and Eben Norton Horsford (1818-1893) evaluated several cases, including personalities from the spiritual context, such as the brothers Ira Erastus Davenport (1811-1839) and William Henry Davenport (1841-1877) and the young women from the Fox family: Katherine (1837-1892), Leah (1814-1890) and Margaret (1833-1893). However, the results were considered inconclusive. Likewise, at the University of Pennsylvania, commissions of inquiry were formed on automatic writing and communication with spirits. Scholars such as George Stuart Fullerton (1859-1925), William Pepper (1843-1898) and Silas Weir Mitchell (1829-1914) investigated a series of mediums. Still, they regretted it as, in most cases, they were amateurs in search of self-promotion (Taylor, 1999).

The difficulties, however, in researching parapsychic phenomena were found on all sides. While conducting the experiments, if, on the one hand, some mediums guarded themselves, imposing different conditions, on the other hand, researchers often assumed positions in favor or against in advance. James was against individuals who had certainties in advance, just as he found scientific sectarianism tedious and far removed from rationality. For the philosopher, what was most lacking in research was criticism and caution. The subject should be treated with the seriousness it deserves, away from mere entertainment. For Taylor (1983), these studies added essential elements in James' psychology, as they demonstrated that the conscious mind was not the only owner of feelings, thoughts and images.

The systematic research of the phenomenon was only started in the United States with the foundation of the American Society for Psychical Research in 1885 in the city of Boston, having as members the president of Harvard, Charles William Eliot (1834-1926), and many professors of the institution, such as Henry Pickering Bowditch (1840-1911), James Jackson Putnam (1846-1918), Charles Sanders Peirce (1839-1914), Richard Hodgson (1855-1905), William James, among others, from the medicine, philosophy and science fields (Taylor, 1999).

In 1886, James served as an officer of the American Society for Psychical Research and headed the committee on studies on hypnotism. James devoted many years and made numerous trips to fulfill the requests of the societies he participated in, investigating various cases. However, from the cases he followed, the most famous is Leonora Evelina Piper's medium. According to Taylor (1999), Piper led an everyday life until 1883, when she had a health problem. Family members indicated that she should consult with J. R. Cocke, a medium recognized for healing phenomena. Cocke was a blind man who went into a trance in personal consultations and indicated treatments. It was possible for those who could not go to him to send letters with locks of the patient's hair; he held them into his hands, thus

determining the disease and the treatment. Piper experienced her first altered states of consciousness in Cocke's presence. In one session, through automatic writing, she delivers a letter to one of those present. The man in question recognizes the message as being from his deceased son. After this event, Piper participates in several mediums seances. As soon as James meets her, he takes her to the American Society of Psychical Research, introducing the medium to other researchers, such as James Hervey Hyslop (1854-1920) and Hogson, who have written about her faculties.

With Piper's consent, James subjected her to the hypnotic state. In some experiments, the medium reached conditions in which her consciousness was erased entirely, and it was possible to stick her with a needle without her showing any reaction. Taylor (1999) still describes experiments in which the medium, in a trance state and eyes closed, imitated James' movements, if he raised his hand to his nose, she repeated the gesture, and so on. Another time, James made a small incision in Piper's arm while in a trance state, without the cut bleeding. This state could be maintained for some time. As soon as she was taken out of the hypnotic state, bleeding occurred. In another experiment under hypnosis, Piper was asked about the numbers and suits of a deck of cards away from her field of vision. After the answers, James separated in piles the hits and errors, highlighting the speed of the replicas and the preponderance of the number of hits.

In no time, James found suspicions about Piper's character and honesty. Unlike other mediums of the time who provided shows, their abilities were limited to ease moving between different states of consciousness. In a hypnotic state or automatic writing, Piper offered detailed information about people and facts or whatever was asked her. The medium still manifested a personality called Reactor⁷, whose powers of discernment surpassed her waking state, giving lengthy advice that satisfied the most critical minds. Piper was called by James his white raven, a metaphor taken from a logical syllogism, represented by the following question: to break the law of universality that all ravens are black, a single white raven is enough. The same would apply to mediumship, regardless of its cause or origin, for the designation of the phenomenon as authentic, a single non-fraudulent medium is enough.

According to Murphy and Ballou (1973), Leonora Piper became the most studied medium in History. These experiments were essential to psychological science, as they demonstrated the intricate relations between the psychic and the biological. The hypnotic state provoked significant alterations in specific involuntary processes of the organism, interfering even in unknown aspects of perception, memory, attention and cognition. Concerning the phenomena studied, James would have stated: "They remain uncertain and await more facts that may not clearly point to a conclusion in fifty or a hundred years" (Barzun, 1983, p. 239). At no time the philosopher positions himself as a spiritualist believer but as a researcher who recognizes a phenomenon and seeks its meaning. Throughout his work, James understands why the mediums' performances are subject to fraud but adds that observing the manifestations, they have similarities, regardless of the part of the world in which they occur and the different times: this should correspond to residues of facts.

James' impressions of psychic experiences a few months before his death reinforce his position that the subconscious was involved in these processes, which led to the knowledge that feelings, thoughts and images were not entirely found in waking consciousness. The mind was to be assessed in its entirety, not only what floated on the surface but also what was submerged. A careful examination of the subject should be guided

⁷ In his work *The secret of the golden flower*, Jung (2013b) states that the male personalities manifested by Piper represent the male element of her unconscious psyche, named in his theory as *animus*.

by the subliminal. This affirmation leaves the denial or affirmation about spiritualist realities in suspension. It only certifies that the events had their emergence and development subconsciously (Taylor, 1999).

Although the Societies have not uncovered indisputable evidence of the reality of life after death, they have contributed significantly to modern dynamic psychology of the unconscious or depth psychology. The experiences with mediums suggested the existence of a portion of the mind not accessible to waking consciousness. Under certain conditions, such as shock, fatigue, physical disturbances, among others, could invade the consciousness, demonstrating its unmistakable existence (Taylor, 1999). James regarded his experiences with Piper as overcoming scientific reductionism. Many scholars considered mediumship as a symptom of nervous diseases, which did not apply to the case in question, a healthy housewife, mother of two, but that she had the remarkable characteristic of being able to transit through different states of consciousness. The mind, in this perspective, would not be a monolithic unit but an aggregate of flows of thoughts, emotions, memories, etc., which would develop in ordinary waking consciousness and at a subliminal level (Ellenberger 1970).

Final considerations

Ellenberger (1970) highlights the importance of the spiritualist movement for the nascent psychological theory of the 19th century. Despite research on altered states of consciousness in earlier decades, it was only between the 1840s and 1850s that the spiritist movement expanded throughout the United States and Europe. From that period onwards, many scientists became interested in the phenomena presented by mediums. As controversial as they may seem, these studies have made significant contributions to the theory of the unconscious. "The advent of Spiritism was an event of great importance in history because it indirectly provided new approaches to the mind to psychologists and psychopathologists" (Ellenberger, 1970, p. 85). Automatic writing and the mediumistic trance manifestation, introduced by spiritualists, were used by researchers as tools to explore the unconscious.

Since his period as a medical student, Jung has been interested in spiritualist literature, researching several authors. In his opinion, theorists such as Kerner, Zöllner and Crookes were the first to report objective parapsychic phenomena (Jung, 1975a). In his analysis, the Swiss author states that unconscious perceptions could explain many events related to spiritism. "With this hypothesis, it is not intended to explain all the ghost phenomena, but at most a certain category of them". Also emphasizing that "Our unconscious possesses very much more subtle powers of perception and reconstruction than our conscious minds" (Jung, 2012a, p. 346).

The anomalous phenomena of consciousness, which were presented in this work, permeate the author's later theories. Among the various themes researched by Jung, we can highlight the relation between conscious and unconscious, his concept of complex and his proposal of synchronicity, as directly linked to these researches (Jung, 2013a). Beyond the dialogues established between Jung and James, we highlight Theodore Flournoy's work from the authors mentioned. By studying the different personalities manifested by Hélène Smith, with thoughts and feelings separate from the waking nature, the researcher from Geneva makes room for the understanding of the psyche as a plural field, with subconscious ideas aggregates of a certain independence. Jung (2013c) will use this proposal for his

theory of complexes. Likewise, Flournoy highlights the existence of prospective psychic processes. In his work, Jung (2013d) will assess the presence of two possibilities for analyzing psychic phenomena: in one of them, named reductive analytic, there is a need for a causal study, which seeks the origins of disorders and neuroses. In another way of analysis, termed constructive or prospective understanding, there is the evaluation of psychic processes in development, indicating a future path to be followed by the individual. Based on these assessments, we highlight the need for further studies on the relation between Jung and Flournoy's works.

Concerning the dialogues between Jung and James, the 1909 event at Clark University represents a historic milestone. From the meeting between the two authors, the formation process of what would later be known as analytical psychology begins. The Swiss psychiatrist's research interests did not resonate with Freud. Finding theoretical and personal support in William James, Jung sees the possibility of charting his path. The importance of Freud for Jung is undeniable, as the Viennese author is objectively referenced in his *Complete works*, especially in the works gathered in the volume Freud and psychoanalysis. However, understanding the theoretical effects of other representative authors becomes fundamental for the apprehension of analytic theory. In his *Complete works*, Jung references William James at various times and in association with multiple themes, such as psychiatric research, evaluation of the unconscious, pluralism, typology and pragmatism, the differences between what the Swiss author named logical thinking and fantasy thinking, the theory of emotions, and religious experience.

In this work, we focus on the themes of the dialogues that occurred at the Clark Conference. Our objective was to broaden the discussion, point out the main studies developed by Jung before meeting with James, and point out the primary psychic research developed by the American thinker. For James, these studies had the perspective, more than confirming religious claims about the phenomenon but bringing contributions to the subliminal's psychology. For Jung, meeting James was an opportunity to share his interests and find encouragement for his research. The American philosopher becomes a role model for the Swiss psychiatrist in his openness of vision and courage to assess the most controversial events.

References

- Bair, D. (2003). *Jung: uma biografia* (Vol. 1). São Paulo, SP: Globo.
- Barzun, J. (1983). *A stroll with William James*. New York, NY: Harper & Row Publishers.
- Charet, F. X. (1993). *Spiritualism and the Foundations of C. G. Jung's Psychology*. Albany, NY: State University of New York.
- Crabtree, A. (1993). *From Mesmer to Freud: magnetic sleep and the roots of psychological healing*. London, UK: Yale University Press.
- Crookes, W. (1927). *Researches in the phenomena of the spiritualism*. London, UK: J. Burns, 15 Southampton Row, Hottorn, W.C. Publicado originalmente em 1874.

- Ellenberger, H. F. (1970). *The discovery of the unconscious: the history and evolution of dynamic psychiatry*. New York, NY: Basic Books.
- Flournoy, T. (2012). *From India to the planet Mars: a study of a case of somnambulism with glossolalia*. London, UK: Forgotten Books. Publicado originalmente em 1900.
- Innamorati, M. (2013). *Jung* (Pensatori/34). Roma, IT: Carocci Editore.
- James, W. (1920). *The letters of William James* (Vol. 2). Boston, MA: The Atlantic Monthly Press.
- James, W. (2010). *The varieties of religious experience: a study in human nature*. New York, NY: Library of America. Publicado originalmente em 1902.
- Jung, C. G. (2013d). Apêndice: a interpretação psicológica dos processos patológicos. In *Psicogênese das doenças mentais* (Vol. 3, p. 200-216). Petrópolis, RJ: Vozes. Publicado originalmente em 1914.
- Jung, C. G. (2013c). Aspectos gerais da psicologia do sonho. In *A natureza da psique* (Vol. 8/1, p. 186-234). Petrópolis, RJ: Vozes. Publicado originalmente em 1928.
- Jung, C. G. (2003). *Cartas de C. G. Jung* (Vol. 3). Petrópolis, RJ: Vozes. Publicado originalmente em 1973.
- Jung, C. G. (2013b). Comentário a “O segredo da flor de ouro”. In *Estudos alquímicos* (Vol. 13, p. 11-62). Petrópolis, RJ: Vozes. Publicado originalmente em 1930.
- Jung, C. G. (2012b). A importância do inconsciente para a educação individual. In *O desenvolvimento da personalidade* (Vol. 17, p. 161-177). Petrópolis, RJ: Vozes. Publicado originalmente em 1925.
- Jung, C. G. (2012c). Introdução a “A psicanálise” de W. M. Kranefeldt. In *Freud e a psicanálise* (Vol. 17, p. 161-177). Petrópolis, RJ: Vozes. Publicado originalmente em 1930.
- Jung, C. G. (1975a). *Memórias, sonhos e reflexões*. Rio de Janeiro, RJ: Nova Fronteira. Publicado originalmente em 1961.
- Jung, C. G. (1960). *Modern psychology: notes on lectures given at the Eidgenössische Technische Hochschule* (Vol. 1, E. Welsh & B. Hannah, Trad.). Zurich, SW: K. Schipert & CO. Publicado originalmente em 1933.
- Jung, C. G. (1975b). The psychological foundations of belief in spirits. In *Structure & dynamics of the psyche*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press. Originally published in 1919.
- Jung, C. G. (1975c). The psychological foundations of belief in spirits. In *Structure & dynamics of the psyche*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press. Note published in the 1948 edition.

- Jung, C. G. (2012d). *Símbolos da transformação* (Vol. 5). Petrópolis, RJ: Vozes. Publicado originalmente em 1952.
- Jung, C. G. (2013a). *Sincronicidade* (Vol. 8/3). Petrópolis, RJ: Vozes. Publicado originalmente em 1952.
- Jung, C. G. (2011). Sobre a psicologia e patologia dos fenômenos chamados ocultos. In *Estudos psiquiátricos* (Vol. 1. p, 11-103). Petrópolis, RJ: Vozes. Publicado originalmente em 1902.
- Jung, C. G. (2012a). Sobre Ocultismo. In.: *A vida simbólica*. (Vol. 18/1, p. 311 – 350). Petrópolis: Vozes. Publicado originalmente em 1905.
- Jung, C. G. (1975d). Synchronicity: an acausal connecting principle. In *Structure & dynamics of the psyche*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University press. Originally published in 1952.
- Kant, I. (1900). *Dreams of spirit-seer*. London, UK: Swan Sonnenschein & Co. Publicado originalmente em 1766.
- Kerner, J. (2012). *The seeress of Prevorst: being revelations concerning the inner-life of man*. London, UK: Forgotten Books. Publicado originalmente em 1829.
- Main, R. (1997). *Jung on synchronicity and the paranormal*. London, UK: Routledge.
- Murphy, G., & Ballou, R. O. (Eds.). (1973). *William James on psychical research*. New York, NY: Augustus M. Kelley Publishers.
- Samuels, A. (1986). *Dicionário crítico de análise junguiana*. Rio de Janeiro, RJ: Rubedo.
- Sech, A. J., Araujo, S. F., & Moreira-Almeida, A. (2013). William James and psychical research: towards a radical science of mind. *History of Psychiatry*, 24, 62-78.
- Shamdasani, S. (2012). *C. G. Jung: a biography in books*. New York, NY: W. W. Norton & Company.
- Sommer, A. (2013). *Crossing the boundaries of mind and body: psychical research and the origins of modern psychology* (PhD). Science and Technology Studies. University College London, London.
- Taylor, E. (1999). *Shadow culture: psychology and spirituality in America*. Washington, D. C.: Counterpoint.
- Taylor, E. (1983). *William James on exception mental states: the 1896 lowell lectures*. New York, NY: Charles Scribner's Sons.
- Treitel, C. (2004). *A science for the soul: occultism and the genesis of the german modern*. Baltimore, ME: The Johns Hopkins University Press.

Zöllner, J. C. F. (1901). *Transcendental physics: an account of experimental investigations from the scientific treatises*. Boston, MA: Banner of Light Publishing CO. Publicado originalmente em 1880.

Zumstein-Preiswerk, S. (1975). *C. G. Jungs medium: die geschichte der Helly Preiswerk*. München, GER: Kindler.

Received: Aug. 2019
Approved: Mar. 26, 2021